E. De Filippo (INFN Catania) (EXOCHINI (Collaboration)

Probing the nuclear symmetry energy with heavy ion collisions

The nuclear EOS describes the relation between pressure, density, temperature and isospin asymmetry. It is an essential ingredient in nuclear physics and astrophysics, but how $E/A(\rho, \delta)$ depends on the density ρ and isospin asymmetry δ ?





The density dependence of symmetry energy should be determined in a coherent way between astrophysical observations and heavy ion phenomenology

The role of isospin asymmetry in nuclear processes in the laboratory and in the cosmos



The key problem: the symmetry energy as a function of the barionic density



Symmetry energy in neutron stars and neutron skin radius



Symmetry energy in neutron stars and neutron skin radius



Symmetry energy in neutron stars and neutron skin radius



Symmetry energy and heavy ion collisions (HIC): Why?

With heavy ion collisions it is possible to access nuclear matter from low densities ($\rho \le \rho_0$, Fermi energies) to high densities ($\rho = 2 - \frac{3\rho_0}{2}$)

SMF ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni 35 A.MeV



With HIC large density variations (density gradients) in nuclear matter can be obtained in a short timescale.

Symmetry energy and heavy ion collisions (HIC): Why?

With heavy ion collisions it is possible to access nuclear matter from low densities ($\rho \le \rho_0$, Fermi energies) to high densities ($\rho = 2-3\rho_0$)



With HIC large density variations (density gradients) in nuclear matter can be obtained in a short timescale.



Bao-An Li, NPA 708 365 (2002)

Heavy ion collisions at Fermi energies: different scenarios and mechanisms



Particle emissions from the early phase of the dynamical evolution (**few fm/c**) up to later stages of statistical decay (**several hundreds of fm/c**) have been measured and are expected to coexist in the reaction products.

Heavy ion collisions at Fermi energies: different scenarios and mechanisms



break-up

Particle emissions from the early phase of the dynamical evolution (**few fm/c**) up to later stages of statistical decay (**several hundreds of fm/c**) have been measured and are expected to coexist in the reaction products.

Nuclear matter symmetry energy at low density ($\rho/\rho_0 \leq 0.2$)

Temperature and density determination from intermediate velocity source in ⁴⁰Ar,⁶⁴Zn + ^{112,124}Sn at 47 A.MeV





R. Wada et al., PRC85, 064618 (2012)
J.B. Natowitz et al., PRL 104 202501 (2010)
K. Hagel et al., EPJA 50:39 (2014)



QS = Quantum Statistical model including clusterization by Typel, Roepke et al., RMF = Relativistic mean field approaches

Nuclear matter symmetry energy at low density ($\rho/\rho_0 \leq 0.2$)

Temperature and density determination from intermediate velocity source in ⁴⁰Ar,⁶⁴Zn + ^{112,124}Sn at 47 A.MeV





R. Wada et al., PRC85, 064618 (2012)J.B. Natowitz et al., PRL 104 202501 (2010)K. Hagel et al., EPJA 50:39 (2014)



QS = Quantum Statistical model including clusterization by Typel, Roepke et al., RMF = Relativistic mean field approaches

Pre-equilibrium nucleons: n/p and scalings laws for clusters



V. Baran et al. Phys. Rep. 410, (2005) Skyrme-like form for mean-field potential seen by protons and neutrons for ¹²⁴Sn

Double Ratio R(n/p) minimizes systematic errors, efficiency problems, etc

Neutron rich Y(n)/Y Neutron poor Y(n)/Y(p)

The idea is to look to the ratio of neutron/proton yield in central collisions (energy spectra of transversely emitted nucleons around 90° in the c.m. system.)

Adapted from Z Chajecki et al., ArXiv:1402:521 (2014)



Pre-equilibrium nucleons: n/p and scalings laws for clusters



V. Baran et al. Phys. Rep. 410, (2005) Skyrme-like form for mean-field potential seen by protons and neutrons for ¹²⁴Sn

Double Ratio R(n/p) minimizes systematic errors, efficiency problems, etc The idea is to look to the ratio of neutron/proton yield in central collisions (energy spectra of transversely emitted nucleons around 90° in the c.m. system.)

Adapted from Z Chajecki et al., ArXiv:1402:521 (2014)



Pre-equilibrium nucleons: n/p and scalings laws for clusters



V. Baran et al. Phys. Rep. 410, (2005) Skyrme-like form for mean-field potential seen by protons and neutrons for ¹²⁴Sn

Double Ratio R(n/p) minimizes systematic errors, efficiency problems, etc

Neutron rich Y(n)/Y Neutron poor Y(n)/Y(p)

The idea is to look to the ratio of neutron/proton yield in central collisions (energy spectra of transversely emitted nucleons around 90° in the c.m. system.)

Adapted from Z Chajecki et al., ArXiv:1402:521 (2014)



Neutron – Protons ratio (pre-equilibrium nucleons)

Nucleons are mostly emitted when system expands and breaks-up at subsaturation densities.

M. Famiano et al. data



Foto: courtesy M. Famiano LASSA+MBall + NEUTRON WALL@MSU

$$S(\rho) = 12.3 \cdot (\rho / \rho_0)^{2/3} + 17.6 \cdot (\rho / \rho_0)^{\gamma}$$

M.B. Tsang et al., PRL 102 122701 (2009) Y. Zhang et al., PLB 664 145 (2008)

ImQMD model with γ between 0.35 and 2.0 (momentum dependent mean field)

Neutron – Protons ratio (pre-equilibrium nucleons)

Nucleons are mostly emitted when system expands and breaks-up at subsaturation densities.

M. Famiano et al. data



M.B. Tsang et al., PRL 102 122701 (2009) Y. Zhang et al., PLB 664 145 (2008)

ImQMD model with γ between 0.35 and 2.0 (momentum dependent mean field)

But: WARNING!!

The role of effective masses can give effects comparable to that of symmetry energy

Foto: courtesy M. Famiano
LASSA+MBall + NEUTRON
WALL@MSU

$$\rho / \rho_{0}^{2/3} + 17.6 \cdot (\rho / \rho_{0})^{\gamma}$$



Competition of reaction mechanisms

N/Z effects in competition between binary reactions and incomplete fusion. Higher probability for fusion using neutron rich systems



G. Cardella et al., PRC 85 084609 (2012) F. Amorini et al., PRL102, 112, 701 (2009)



Competition of reaction mechanisms

N/Z effects in competition between binary reactions and incomplete fusion. Higher probability for fusion using neutron rich systems

Comparison with **CoMD** model (*M*. Papa et G. Giuliani, EPJA 39, 17 (2009): the good matching with experimental data is obtained by a stiff symmetry energy term $(\gamma=1.1\pm0.1)$





G. Cardella et al., PRC 85 084609 (2012) F. Amorini et al., PRL102, 112, 701 (2009)

Heavy ion collisions at Fermi energies: different scenarios and mechanisms



Semi-peripheral events are characterized by binary reactons where projectile and target nuclei experience a substantial overlap of matter.

Isospin transport through the "neck"

V. Baran et al., PRC 72 064620 (2005)



Isospin diffusion

Isospin gradient (N/Z asymmetry in the initial system) Depending on absolute value of the symmetry energy Isospin equilibration between projectile and target

Isospin transport through the "neck"

V. Baran et al., PRC 72 064620 (2005)



Isospin diffusion

Isospin gradient (N/Z asymmetry in the initial system) Depending on absolute value of the symmetry energy Isospin equilibration between projectile and target



Comparison with ImQMD model (Best fit obtained with γ =0.75 at b=6 fm.

Results of χ^2 analysis on compared isospin diffusion and n/p ratios data:

0.45≤γ≤1 50≤L≤85 MeV

 $R_7 = f(Y(^7Li)/Y(^7Be))$



Isospin equilibration depends from **S (ρ)** value at subsaturation density and is favoured by a **SOFT term of ASY-EOS. Less mixing with a STIFF asy-EOS.** ¹²⁴Sn + ¹¹²Sn (AB) mixed → diffusion
 ¹¹²Sn + ¹²⁴Sn (BA) mixed → diffusion 50 A.MeV

$$R_{i}(x_{AB}) = 2 \cdot \frac{x_{AB} - (x_{AA} + x_{BB})/2}{x_{AA} - x_{BB}}$$

 $R_i = \pm 1$ no diffusion; $R_i = 0$ equilibration

X is an "isospin" observable and is rescaled according to R_i (transport ratio)



Comparison with ImQMD model (Best fit obtained with γ =0.75 at b=6 fm.

Results of χ² analysis on compared isospin diffusion and n/p ratios data:

0.45≤γ≤1 50≤L≤85 MeV

 $R_7 = f(Y(^7Li)/Y(^7Be))$



Isospin equilibration depends from **S (ρ)** value at subsaturation density and is favoured by a **SOFT term of ASY-EOS. Less mixing with a STIFF asy-EOS.** ¹²⁴Sn + ¹¹²Sn (AB) mixed → diffusion
¹¹²Sn + ¹²⁴Sn (BA) mixed → diffusion 50 A.MeV

$$E_{sym} = E_{sym}^{kin} + E_{sym}^{pot}$$

= $12 \text{MeV} \cdot (\rho/\rho_0)^{2/3} + 22 \text{MeV} \cdot (\rho/\rho_0)^{\gamma}$

 $R_i = \pm 1$ no diffusion; $R_i = 0$ equilibration

X is an "isospin" observable and is rescaled according to R_i (transport ratio)



0.4≤γ_i≤1

1.0

Density ρ/ρ_0

1.5

2.0

0.5

10

0.0

 $R_7 = f(Y(^7Li)/Y(^7Be))$



Isospin equilibration depends from **S**(**ρ**) value at subsaturation density and is favoured by a SOFT term of ASY-EOS. Less mixing with a STIFF asy-EOS.



 $R_7 = f(Y(^7Li)/Y(^7Be))$



Isospin equilibration depends from **S (ρ)** value at subsaturation density and is favoured by a **SOFT term of ASY-EOS. Less mixing with a STIFF asy-EOS.**



Improvement with RIBS

Isospin diffusion: Sn+Sn@35 A.MeV

Z.Y. Sun et al, CHIMERA-MSU collaboration PRC82, 051603 (2011)





Isospin diffusion: Sn+Sn@35 A.MeV

Z.Y. Sun et al, CHIMERA-MSU collaboration PRC82, 051603 (2011)







Isospin transport by looking at the quasi-projectile

 $\overset{\mathrm{b}}{\overset{\mathrm{D}}{\boxtimes}}^{1.1}_{1.08}$ 1.1 asy-soft+simon asy-stiff+simon 1.08 to and a constant of the second secon 1.06 1.04 1.04 1.02 1.02 Ni+Au 52A MeV Ni+Au 74A MeV 0.98 data forward **OP** 0.98 data forward NN 0 0.8 0.2 0.4 0.20.6 0.8 0.40.6 0 1.1 ^{1.1} (ZZ) 1.08 (ZZ) 1.06 1.1 1.08 1.06 1.06 1.04 1.04 000000000 0000000000 1.02 1.02 1 Ni+Ni 74A MeV Ni+Ni 52A MeV 0.98 0.98 0.2 0.6 0.8 0.2 0.4 0.6 0.8 0.4 E_{diss}/E_{c.m.} E_{diss}/E_{c.m.}

Data compared to Stochastic Mean Field (SMF) Asy-stiff parametrization better reproduce data

see E. Galichet et al., PRC79 064615 (2009) G. Ademard et al., EPJA 50:33 (2014)

Indra@GANIL



Isospin equilibration is reached for more dissipative collisions. Here X (isospin variable in R^t) = triton multiplicity



Disentangling dynamical vs. statistical emission in ternary events



Disentangling dynamical vs. statistical emission in ternary events



Disentangling dynamical vs. statistical emission in ternary events



cos(θ)≈±1
aligned emission of the
lighter fragment in the
backward emisphere of
PLF (+1) and TLF (-1)
towards midrapidity

Enhancement of backward fragment yield relative to the forward component



S. Hudan et al., PRC **86** 021603 (2012) R. Brown et al., PRC 87 061601 (2013)

Stochastic Mean Field (SMF) + GEMINI calculation

CHIMERA @ LNS





E.d.F. et al., Phys. Rev. C 86 014610 (2012)

Experimental <N/Z> distribution of IMFs as a function of their atomic number compared with results SMF+GEMINI calculations (hatchad area) for two different parametrizations of the symmetry potential (asysoft and asy-stiff)



See also: S. Hudan et al., PRC **86** 021603(R) 2012. K. Brown et al., PRC **87** 061601 (2013)

Stochastic Mean Field (SMF) + GEMINI calculation





E.d.F. et al., Phys. Rev. C 86 014610 (2012)

021603(R) 2012. K. Brown et al., PRC **87** 061601 (2013)

Stochastic Mean Field (SMF) + GEMINI calculation

CHIMERA @ LNS





E.d.F. et al., Phys. Rev. C 86 014610 (2012)

Experimental <N/Z> distribution of IMFs as a function of their atomic number compared with results SMF+GEMINI calculations (hatchad area) for two different parametrizations of the symmetry potential (asysoft and asy-stiff)



See also: S. Hudan et al., PRC **86** 021603(R) 2012. K. Brown et al., PRC **87** 061601 (2013)

Stochastic Mean Field (SMF): ratio (a) ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni / ¹²⁴Xe+⁶⁴Zn





Comparison with FAZIA data ⁸⁴Kr + ^{112,124}Sn data 35 A.MeV

FAZIA data: ⁸⁴Kr+^{112,124}Sn Selection based on particles velocity

> Chimera data (triangles): ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni Selection based on angular correlations

S. Barlini et al., Phys. Rev. C87, 054607 (2013)





Fazia@LNS

Density determination: three body analysis in the experimental data



In the 3-bodies center-of-mass system:



PLF(2) $Q^{\gamma} \qquad PLF(2)$ $P_{1-23} \qquad IMF(1)$ TLF(3)

$$E_{TOT}^{c.m.} = E_1 + E_2 + E_3 = \frac{p_{1-23}^2}{\mu_{1-23}} + \frac{p_{23}^2}{\mu_{23}} = E_{1-23} + E_{23}$$

The ratio $E_{1-23}/E_{COULOMB}$ is calculated considering for the IMFs a dilute configuration with $r_0=1.8A^{1/3}$ fm (filled histogram corresponding to about 0.05 ρ_0) resulting from average values of SMF calculation ($\rho=0.05-0.06$ $1/fm^3$)

Proceedings INPC2013: E.d.F. et al., EPJ WoC 66, 03032 (2014)



The time-scale of the process as a function of the incident energy and impact parameter could be the main signature among different mechanisms:

- Early neck fragmentation (40-120 fm/c)
- Dynamical fission (120-300 fm/c
- Equilibrated fission (>1000 fm/c)

With respect to the prompt neck emission, the emission of heavy IMFs from projectile-like fragment break-up appears at a later stage

The inset of quasi-projectile dynamical fission



Coulomb ring $5 \ll V_{\text{beam}} = 8$. cm/ns \rightarrow Well defined PLF source: scattering of PLF followed by its splitting in H&L fragments \rightarrow sequential mechanism!!!

The inset of quasi-projectile dynamical fission



Coulomb ring $5 \ll V_{\text{beam}} = 8$. cm/ns \rightarrow Well defined PLF source: scattering of PLF followed by its splitting in H&L fragments \rightarrow sequential mechanism!!!

Comparison of IMFs cross sections for ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni and ¹¹²Sn+⁵⁸Ni







Dynamical component: enhanced in the neutron rich
Statistical component: almost equal (ratio: ~1.1)

Comparison of IMFs cross sections for ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni and ¹¹²Sn+⁵⁸Ni

Main experimental result: the dynamical component is enhanced for the neutron rich system.

Is it a size (mass) effect or isospin effect ?

The Inkiissy experiment at LNS

System	N/Z Projectile	N/Z target	N/Z compound
¹²⁴ Sn+ ⁶⁴ Ni	1.48	1.29	1.41
¹²⁴ Xe+ ⁶⁴ Zn	1.30	1.13	1.24
¹¹² Sn+ ⁵⁸ Ni	1.24	1.07	1.18

see Lucia Quattrocchi poster for details

the 4π CHIMERA + a module of FARCOS prototype



See E.V. Pagano talk

Comparison of IMFs cross sections for ¹²⁴Sn+⁶⁴Ni and ¹¹²Sn+⁵⁸Ni

Main experimental result: the dynamical component is enhanced for the neutron rich system.

Is it a size (mass) effect or isospin effect ?

The Inkiissy experiment at LNS

System	N/Z Projectile	N/Z target	N/Z compound
¹²⁴ Sn+ ⁶⁴ Ni	1.48	1.29	1.41
¹²⁴ Xe+ ⁶⁴ Zn	1.30	1.13	1.24
¹¹² Sn+ ⁵⁸ Ni	1.24	1.07	1.18

see Lucia Quattrocchi poster for details

the 4π CHIMERA + a module of FARCOS prototype



SPES letter of intent 2014



See E.V. Pagano talk

Transverse flow of IMFs and symmetry energy



Transverse flow: provides information on the azimuthal anisotropy in the reaction plane.



Elliptic flow: measures the competition between in plane and out-of-plane emission



NIMROD-ISiS@TAMU



See P. Russotto talk for "flow" measurements at relativistic energies

Transverse flow of IMFs and symmetry energy



Transverse flow: *provides information on the azimuthal anisotropy in the reaction plane*.



Elliptic flow: measures the competition between in plane and out-of-plane emission





See P. Russotto talk for "flow" measurements at relativistic energies

Exploiting RIBS and neutron detection (a way for the future ?)

CoMD calculation showing the sensitivity to L for the <N/Z> of the quasi-projectile residue in ³²Mg +⁹Be respect to ²⁴Mg +⁹Be at 73 MeV/A



Adapted from Z. Kohley et al., PRC 88 041601 (2013)



Neutron angular distributions and velocity in coincidence with Z=4 fragments. CoMD calculations with L=78 MeV are in green (Data from Z.Kohley et al. PRC88 with the MoNA Neutron Array).





Collection of available estimates of the slope parameter L



Adapted from X. Vinas et al., EPJA 50:27 (2014) Z.Y. Sun et al., PRC82 051603 (2010) (Chimera/MSU data)
E. Galichet et al. PRC 79 064615 (2009) (INDRA data)
E.d.F. et al. PRC 86 014610 (2012) (Chimera data)
Z. Kohley et al., PRC 88 041601 (2013) (TAMU data)

What we learn from Heavy Ion collisions and nuclear structure probes ?



Adapted from C.J. Horowitz et al., ArXiv 1401:5839 (2014)

As a function of incident energy, impact parameter, isospin asymmetry, it is possible to span from low to high densities with HIC

A stringent test and constraint on trasport model and dynamical theories

Unique possibility to explore the critical region at $2-3\rho_0$

High densities behaviour of symmetry energy: a controversial problem



The effect of three body forces (TBF) is weak at low density but at supra-saturation densities leads to a stiffening of the symmetry energy with density. In neutron matter the short-range repulsive part of 3-body force is dominant.

Using Pion and Kaon probes

FOPI IQMD (Nantes) ImIQMD (linear) mIQMD (soft) 3 ImIQMD (supersoft) ImIQMD (stiff) π /π^{+} superstiff 2 0.4 0.8 1.2 1.6 E_{lab} (A GeV)





 Δ resonance: $Y(\pi-)/Y(\pi+) \approx (N/Z)^2_{dense}$ Statistic model: $\mu(\pi^+)-\mu(\pi^-)=2 (\mu_p-\mu_n)$

Z. Feng et al. PLB 683 140, 2010

W. Reisdorf et al. NPA 781 459, 2007

FOPI data

É=400 A.MeV

N/Z

1.4

1.6

supersoft

- soft

linear

hard

3.5

3.0

2.5

1.5

1.0

1.0



Z. Xiao et al. PRL 102 062509, 2009

W. Xie et al. PLB 718 1510, 2013

1.2

Using Pion and Kaon probes

Z. Feng et al. PLB 683 140, 2010





Helitro

Plastic Barrel

Plastic Wall

 $\Delta \text{ resonance:}$ $Y(\pi-)/Y(\pi+) \approx (N/Z)^2_{\text{dense}}$ Statistic model: $\mu(\pi^+)-\mu(\pi^-)=2 (\mu_p-\mu_n)$

W. Reisdorf et al. NPA 781 459, 2007

4	3.5			
◆ FOPI ▲ MDI x=1	Z. Xiao, B-An Li et al.	IBUU4	supersoft	
3- +	Z. Feng et al.	IMQMD	superstiff	
Supersott	G. Ferini et al.	RMF	stiff (linear)	
	W. Reisdorf	IQMD	soft (or no influence)	
	W.J. Xie et al.	ImIBL	supersoft	
E _{beam} (AGeV)	N/Z			
Z. Xiao et al. PRL 102 062509, 2009	W. Xie et al. PLB 718 1510), 2013		

FOPI@GSI

Using Pion and Kaon probes



(right) for a central (b = 0 fm impact parameter) Au+Au collision at 1 AGeV incident energy. Transport calculations using the NL, $NL\rho$ and $NL\rho\delta$ models for the iso-vector part of the nuclear EoS are shown.

X. Lopez et al., PRC 75, 011901 (2007).

New observables proposed : using n mesons or high energy photons (G.C. Yong and Bao-An Li Phys. Lett B 723, 388 (2013).

Neutron and proton elliptic flow: the AsyEos experiment at GSI





Measure differential flow and ratios for π^+/π^- p/n t/³He at energies around or below 300 A.MeV with RIB beams like ¹³²Sn, ¹⁰⁸Sn, ⁵²Ca, ³⁶Ca

WHAT NEXT ?

A relative consistence analysis have been obtained from HIC but with yet large uncertainties.

Use of new RIB facilities (exotic neutron rich, proton rich beams: isospin effects are enhanced by increasing the system asymmetry. Comparison with stable beam needed.



Other signals: use of femtoscopy for a precise space-time sources characterization. Neutron signals (np correlations, n/p double ratios....). New detectors.



100

(MeV

Esperiment to measure the symmetry energy at supra saturation density are now fundamental. FOPI systematics and the ASYEOS@GSI experiment results are a good starting point for the future . Future efforts at RIKEN, FRIB (MSU), FAIR (GSI) with new devices (NEWLAND, SAMURAI TPC, R3B) and new RIB facilities.

FINE

Particle-particle correlations and symmetry energy: a difficult task

IBUU simulations

⁵²Ca + ⁴⁸Ca E/A=80 MeV, Central collisions L.W. Chen, V. Greco , C. Ko, B-An Li, PRC68, 014605(2003)

$$1 + R(q) = k \cdot \frac{\Sigma Y_{\text{coinc}}(\vec{p}_1, \vec{p}_2)}{\Sigma Y_{\text{evt.mixing}}(\vec{p}_1, \vec{p}_2)}$$



Shorter neutron and proton average emission times and more similar n and p emission times with Esym - stiff



Particle-particle correlations and symmetry energy: a difficult task



Particle-particle correlations and symmetry energy: a difficult task

IBUU simulations

⁵²Ca + ⁴⁸Ca E/A=80 MeV, Central collisions L.W. Chen, V. Greco , C. Ko, B-An Li, PRC68, 014605(2003)

$$1 + R(q) = k \cdot \frac{\Sigma Y_{coinc}(\vec{p}_1, \vec{p}_2)}{\Sigma Y_{evt.mixing}(\vec{p}_1, \vec{p}_2)}$$



Shorter neutron and proton average emission times and more similar n and p emission times with Esym - stiff



A new setup: the 4π CHIMERA + a module of FARCOS prototype

FARCOS: Femtoscope Array for COrrelations and Spectroscopy (INFN, Ganil, Huelva . . .)

- Based on (62x64x64 mm³) clusters
- 1 square (0.3x62x62 mm³) DSSSD 32+32 strips
- 1 square (1.5x62x62 mm³) DSSSD 32+32 strips
- 4 60x32x32 mm³ CsI(Tl) crystals



See T. Minniti talk (Wednesday)



4 telescopes 25 cm from the target $\theta_{\text{lab}} \sim$ 16-44 deg, $~~\Delta \varphi \sim$ 45 deg



