### Measuring Quantum Discord at the LHC (for top quarks) $\hat{z} = |0\rangle$

Navin McGinnis Based on collaboration w/ Tao Han (Pitt), Matt Low (Pitt), and Shufang Su (AZ) 2412.21158 [hep-ph]

Quantum Observables for Collider Physics 2025 GGI April 10, 2025





 $-\hat{z} =$ 

### Exploring Quantum Mechanics in High Energy Physics @ PITT PACC - March 2024





#### Entanglement and quantum tomography with top quarks at the LHC

Yoav Afik<sup>1,</sup>\* and Juan Ramón Muñoz de Nova<sup>2,†</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Experimental Physics Department, CERN, 1211 Geneva, Switzerland <sup>2</sup>Departamento de Física de Materiales, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, E-28040 Madrid, Spain (Dated: September 8, 2021)



Coherence Quantum Discord Entanglement Steerability

Nonlocality

#### Entanglement and quantum tomography with top quarks at the LHC

Yoav Afik<sup>1,</sup>\* and Juan Ramón Muñoz de Nova<sup>2,</sup><sup>†</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Experimental Physics Department, CERN, 1211 Geneva, Switzerland <sup>2</sup>Departamento de Física de Materiales, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, E-28040 Madrid, Spain (Dated: September 8, 2021)



# Boundary of quantum Information

#### Entanglement and quantum tomography with top quarks at the LHC

Yoav Afik<sup>1,</sup> \* and Juan Ramón Muñoz de Nova<sup>2,</sup> †

<sup>1</sup>Experimental Physics Department, CERN, 1211 Geneva, Switzerland <sup>2</sup>Departamento de Física de Materiales, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, E-28040 Madrid, Spain (Dated: September 8, 2021)



## Local quantum uncertainty Boundary of quantum Information





#### Quantum discord and steering in top quarks at the LHC

Yoav Afik<sup>1,</sup> \* and Juan Ramón Muñoz de Nova<sup>2,</sup> †

<sup>1</sup>Experimental Physics Department, CERN, 1211 Geneva, Switzerland <sup>2</sup>Departamento de Física de Materiales, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, E-28040 Madrid, Spain (Dated: June 7, 2023)





Quantum Discord

### $\rho = |A, B > \langle A, B|$

# $\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$

 $I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$  $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$ 

Quantum Discord

### $\rho = |A, B > \langle A, B|$

# $\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$



Quantum Discord

### $\rho = |A, B > < A, B|$

# $\mathcal{D}_A( ho) = I( ho) - J_A( ho)$ Mutual Information Co (all correlations) (o

 $I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$  $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$ 

Conditional information (only classical correlations)

Quantum Discord

## $\rho = |A, B > \langle A, B|$



 $I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$  $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$ 

Conditional information (only classical correlations)

Quantum Discord

## $\rho = |A, B > \langle A, B|$



 $I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$  $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$ 

Conditional information (only classical correlations)



$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$$
$$J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$$

 $J_A(\rho_{AB};\hat{n}) = S(\rho_A) - S(\rho_A|\rho_B;\hat{n}).$ 

$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$$
$$J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$$

 $J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n}) = S(\rho_A) - S(\rho_A | \rho_B; \hat{n}).$ 

$$\Pi_{\pm \hat{n}} = \mathbb{I}_2 \otimes |\pm n\rangle \langle \pm n|$$
$$(\vec{\sigma} \cdot \hat{n} |\pm n\rangle = \pm |\pm n\rangle)$$



$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$$
$$J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$$

 $J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n}) = S(\rho_A) - S(\rho_A | \rho_B; \hat{n}).$ 

$$\Pi_{\pm \hat{n}} = \mathbb{I}_2 \otimes |\pm n\rangle \langle \pm n|$$
$$(\vec{\sigma} \cdot \hat{n} |\pm n\rangle = \pm |\pm n\rangle)$$

$$S(\rho_A|\rho_B;\hat{n}) = p_{+\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}})$$

$$\rho_{\pm\hat{n}} = \frac{1}{p_{\pm\hat{n}}}\operatorname{tr}_B(\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}}\rho_{AB}\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}})$$

$$p_{\pm\hat{n}} = \operatorname{tr}(\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}}\rho_{AB}\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}})$$





$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB})$$
$$J_A(\rho_{AB}) = \max_{\hat{n}} J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n})$$

 $J_A(\rho_{AB}; \hat{n}) = S(\rho_A) - S(\rho_A | \rho_B; \hat{n}).$ 

$$\Pi_{\pm \hat{n}} = \mathbb{I}_2 \otimes |\pm n\rangle \langle \pm n|$$
$$(\vec{\sigma} \cdot \hat{n} |\pm n\rangle = \pm |\pm n\rangle)$$

 $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) - \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_{+\hat{n}} S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}} S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}) \right)$ 

$$S(\rho_A|\rho_B;\hat{n}) = p_{+\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}})$$

$$\rho_{\pm\hat{n}} = \frac{1}{p_{\pm\hat{n}}}\mathrm{tr}_B(\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}}\rho_{AB}\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}})$$

$$p_{\pm\hat{n}} = \mathrm{tr}(\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}}\rho_{AB}\Pi_{\pm\hat{n}})$$





 $I(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) + S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB}).$ 



17

 $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) - \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_{+\hat{n}} S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}} S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}) \right)$ 



 $J_A(\rho_{AB}) = S(\rho_A) - \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_{+\hat{n}} S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}} S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}) \right)$ 



$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$= S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB}) + \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_+ \frac{1}{\hat{n}} \right)$$

$$\rho = \frac{1}{4} \Big[ \mathbf{1}_2 \otimes \mathbf{1}_2 + \sum_{i=1}^3 B_i^+(\sigma_i \otimes \mathbf{1}_2) + \sum_{i=1}^3 B_j^-(\mathbf{1}_2 \otimes \sigma_j) + \sum_{i,j=1}^3 C_{ij}(\sigma_i \otimes \sigma_j) \Big]$$

$$p_{\pm \hat{n}} = \frac{1 \pm \hat{\mathbf{n}} \cdot \mathbf{B}^-}{2}, \qquad \qquad \rho_{\pm \hat{n}} = \frac{\mathbb{I}_2 + \mathbb{I}_2}{2}$$

 $_{+\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}}S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}))$ 

 $\frac{\mathbf{B}_{\pm \hat{\mathbf{n}}}^{+} \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma}}{2}, \qquad \mathbf{B}_{\pm \hat{\mathbf{n}}}^{+} = \frac{\mathbf{B}^{+} \pm \mathbf{C} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{n}}}{1 \pm \hat{\mathbf{n}} \cdot \mathbf{B}^{-}}.$ 

20

$$\mathcal{D}_A(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_A(\rho)$$
$$= S(\rho_B) - S(\rho_{AB}) + \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_+ \frac{1}{\hat{n}} \right)$$



 $_{+\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}}S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}))$ 

$$\mathcal{D}_{A}(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_{A}(\rho)$$

$$= S(\rho_{B}) - S(\rho_{AB}) + \min_{\hat{n}} \left(p_{+}\right)$$

$$\rho = \frac{1}{4} \Big[ \mathbf{1}_{2} \otimes \mathbf{1}_{2} + \sum_{i=1}^{3} B_{i}^{+}(\sigma_{i} \otimes \mathbf{1}_{2}) + \sum_{i=1}^{3} B_{i}^{-}(\mathbf{1}_{2} \otimes \sigma_{j}) + \sum_{i,j}^{3} D_{A} \otimes V_{B} \longrightarrow U_{A}^{\dagger} \otimes V_{B}^{\dagger}$$

$$\rho_{AB}' = \frac{1}{4} \left( \mathbb{I}_{4} + \sum_{i} \Lambda_{i} \sigma_{i} \otimes \sigma_{i} \right)$$

 $_{+\hat{n}}S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}}S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}))$ 

 $\sum_{i,j=1}^{3} C_{ij}(\sigma_i \otimes \sigma_j) \Big]$ 

## $\Lambda_i$ = Singular values of $C_{ij}$ in any basis of choice

$$\mathcal{D}_{A}(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_{A}(\rho)$$
  
=  $S(\rho_{B}) - S(\rho_{AB}) + \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_{+\hat{n}} S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}} S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}) \right)$ 

$$\begin{aligned} D_A(\rho'_{AB}) &= 1 + \sum_i e_i \log_2(e_i) - \frac{1}{2}(1+\lambda) \log_2\left(\frac{1+\lambda}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{2}(1-\lambda) \log_2\left(\frac{1-\lambda}{2}\right) \\ e_i &= \text{Eigenvalues of } \rho_{AB} \\ \lambda &= \text{Largest singular value of } C_{ij} \end{aligned}$$



$$\mathcal{D}_{A}(\rho) = I(\rho) - J_{A}(\rho)$$
  
=  $S(\rho_{B}) - S(\rho_{AB}) + \min_{\hat{n}} \left( p_{+\hat{n}} S(\rho_{+\hat{n}}) + p_{-\hat{n}} S(\rho_{-\hat{n}}) \right)$ 

$$\begin{split} D_A(\rho'_{AB}) &= 1 + \sum_i e_i \log_2(e_i) - \frac{1}{2}(1+\lambda) \log_2\left(\frac{1+\lambda}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{2}(1-\lambda) \log_2\left(\frac{1-\lambda}{2}\right) \\ e_i &= \text{Eigenvalues of } \rho_{AB} \\ \lambda &= \text{Largest singular value of } C_{ij} \end{split}$$

Calculation appeared before:

S. Luo, Quantum discord for two-qubit systems, Phys. Rev. A 77 (2008) 042303.





$$\begin{split} D_A(\rho'_{AB}) &= 1 + \sum_i e_i \log_2 (e_i) - \frac{1}{2} (1+\lambda) \log_2 \left(\frac{1+\lambda}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{2} (1-\lambda) \log_2 \left(\frac{1-\lambda}{2}\right) \\ e_i &= \text{Eigenvalues of } \rho_{AB} \\ \lambda &= \text{Largest singular value of } C_{ij} \\ D_A(\rho_{AB}) &= 1 + \frac{1}{4} (1-C_k - C_n - C_r) \log_2 \left(\frac{(1-C_k - C_n - C_r)}{4}\right) \\ &+ \frac{1}{4} (1+C_k - C_n + C_r) \log_2 \left(\frac{(1+C_k - C_n - C_r)}{4}\right) \\ &+ \frac{1}{4} (1+C_n - \Delta) \log_2 \left(\frac{(1+C_n - \Delta)}{4}\right) + \frac{1}{4} (1+C_n + \Delta) \log_2 \left(\frac{(1+C_n + \Delta)}{4}\right) \\ &- \frac{1}{2} (1+\lambda) \log_2 \left(\frac{1+\lambda}{2}\right) - \frac{1}{2} (1-\lambda) \log_2 \left(\frac{1-\lambda}{2}\right) \end{split}$$

where 
$$\Delta = \sqrt{C_k^2 + 4C_{kr}^2 + C_r^2 - 2C_kC_r}$$
, and  $\lambda$ 

#### Experiments

 $\Delta = \max\{|C_n|, \frac{1}{2}|C_k + C_r - \Delta|, \frac{1}{2}|C_k + C_r + \Delta|\}.$ 









 $C[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0 \implies C[\rho] \neq 0$ 

K. Cheng, T. Han, M. Low: Phys.Rev.D 109 (2024)



 $C[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0 \implies C[\rho] \neq 0$ 

K. Cheng, T. Han, M. Low: Phys.Rev.D 109 (2024)

### For discord, it can be disastrous:



 $C[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0 \implies C[\rho] \neq 0$ 

K. Cheng, T. Han, M. Low: Phys.Rev.D 109 (2024)

For discord, it can be disastrous:

 Set of zero-discord states not convex: mixtures of zero-discord states can lead to a fictitious states with  $D_A[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0..$ 

$$\bar{\rho} = \lambda \rho_0 + (1 - \lambda) \rho'_0$$





#### Discord at colliders

#### Quantum Discord and the Geometry of Bell-Diagonal States

Matthias D. Lang<sup>\*</sup> and Carlton M. Caves Center for Quantum Information and Control, University of New Mexico, MSC07-4220, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87131-0001, USA (Dated: July 25, 2018)



#### Discord at colliders

#### Quantum Discord and the Geometry of Bell-Diagonal States

Matthias D. Lang<sup>\*</sup> and Carlton M. Caves Center for Quantum Information and Control, University of New Mexico, MSC07-4220, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87131-0001, USA (Dated: July 25, 2018)





#### Discord at colliders

#### Quantum Discord and the Geometry of Bell-Diagonal States

Matthias D. Lang<sup>\*</sup> and Carlton M. Caves

Center for Quantum Information and Control, University of New Mexico, MSC07-4220, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87131-0001, USA (Dated: July 25, 2018)







big a deal:  $C[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0 \implies C[\rho] \neq 0$ 

K. Cheng, T. Han, M. Low: Phys.Rev.D 109 (2024)

For discord, it can be disastrous:

 Set of zero-discord states not convex: mixtures of zero-discord states can lead to a fictitious states with  $D_A[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0..$ 

$$\bar{\rho} = \lambda \rho_0 + (1 - \lambda) \rho'_0$$









big a deal:  $C[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0 \implies C[\rho] \neq 0$ 

K. Cheng, T. Han, M. Low: Phys.Rev.D 109 (2024)

For discord, it can be disastrous:

 Set of zero-discord states not convex: mixtures of zero-discord states can lead to a fictitious states with  $D_A[\bar{\rho}] \neq 0$ ..

Two solutions:

- Measure discord in regions of phase space which give an entangled fictitious state
- Restrict phase space to regions where all sub-states have  $D_A[\rho] \neq 0$



## Three signal regions:

- Threshold
- Separable
- Boosted





## Three signal regions:

- Threshold
- Separable
- Boosted

### Contours of concurrence













 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not\!\!\!E_T.$ 

#### • Decay method







 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not\!\!\!E_T.$ 

#### • Decay method



|               | Threshold Region                 |                    | Separable Region                 |                    | Boosted Region                   |                    |
|---------------|----------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------|
|               | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A( ho_{tar t})$ | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A( ho_{tar t})$ | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A( ho_{tar t})$ |
| Parton        |                                  | $0.200\pm0.003$    |                                  | $0.255 \pm 0.008$  |                                  | $0.197 \pm 0.003$  |
| Reconstructed | 0.10                             | $0.23\pm0.04$      | 0.28                             | $0.18\pm0.05$      | 0.08                             | $0.20\pm0.05$      |

Uncertainties: statistical  $\mathscr{L} = 139 \text{ fb}^{-1} + \text{syst.}$  (detector efficiencies + unfolding)









 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not\!\!\!E_T.$ 

• Kinematic method





K. Cheng, T> Han, M. Low <u>2410.08303</u> [hep-ph]



 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not\!\!\!E_T.$ 

• Kinematic method



$$C_{ij}^{\text{helicity}} = \begin{pmatrix} C_k(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & C_{kr}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & 0\\ C_{kr}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & C_r(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & 0\\ 0 & 0 & C_n(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) \end{pmatrix},$$



K. Cheng, T> Han, M. Low <u>2410.08303</u> [hep-ph]



 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not\!\!\!E_T.$ 

#### Kinematic method





 $C_{ij}^{\text{helicity}} = \begin{pmatrix} C_k(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & C_{kr}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & 0\\ C_{kr}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & C_r(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) & 0\\ 0 & 0 & C_n(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}}) \end{pmatrix}$ 

Subtlety:  $\mathcal{O}(C_{ij})$  for non-linear observables, e.g. Discord, VN entropy, etc. (for Bell can do  $\mathscr{B}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}})$ )



 $pp \to t\bar{t} \to \ell^{\pm}\ell^{\mp} + \text{jets} + \not{E}_T.$ 

#### Kinematic method



|   |               | Threshold Region                 |                                 | Separable Region                 |                                  | Boosted Region                   |                                    |
|---|---------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------------|
|   |               | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A( ho_{t\bar{t}})	imes 10^3$ | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A( ho_{t\bar{t}}) 	imes 10^3$ | $\langle \epsilon_{rec} \rangle$ | $D_A(\rho_{t\bar{t}}) \times 10^3$ |
| Р | arton         |                                  | $173.42\pm0.07$                 |                                  | $249.72\pm0.24$                  |                                  | $200.81\pm0.08$                    |
| R | Reconstructed | 0.10                             | $147.10\pm0.24$                 | 0.28                             | $232.54\pm0.47$                  | 0.08                             | $188.49\pm0.25$                    |

Subtlety:  $\mathcal{O}(\overline{C}_{ij})$  for non-linear observables, e.g. Discord, VN entropy, etc. (for Bell can do  $\overline{\mathscr{B}}(\theta, M_{t\bar{t}})$ )





#### Kinematic method



Subtlety:  $\mathcal{O}(C_{ij})$  for Discord, VN entrop,

![](_page_45_Picture_5.jpeg)

| Metric    | Measured       |  |  |  |  |
|-----------|----------------|--|--|--|--|
| D=Tr[C]/3 | -0.221 ± 0.010 |  |  |  |  |
| Magic     | 0.238 ± 0.014  |  |  |  |  |
| Discord   | 0.073 ± 0.010  |  |  |  |  |
| LQU       | 0.051 ± 0.007  |  |  |  |  |

(Using full spin-density matrix)

Obtained from the **inclusive**  $(100k \text{ toys}) \rightarrow \text{clear observa}$ But how do w avnarimantal

#### From yesterday's talk:

### Est. precision w/ <u>actual</u> data: ~14%

### Summary

- Discord is a clear next step in the exploration of QI at colliders
  - Computable analytically for  $t\bar{t}$  (at LO) in terms of "collider friendly" observables
  - Can be framed in robust way in terms of existing analysis strategies
- Important subtleties uncovered (convexity, linearity) which must be considered for other observables
- Future directions:
  - Higher order effects
  - CP-odd corrections (EW, NP)

(dilepton, lepton + jets, etc.), clear advantages for kinematic method