

Theory of leptonic flavor mixing

Gui-Jun Ding

University of Science and Technology of China

The XXXI International Conference on Neutrino Physics and Astrophysics June 18, 2024 Milan, Italy





Flavor problems of SM



Quark mixing vs lepton mixing

Quark mixings are small

		0.974	0.225	0.004
V_{CKM}	≈	0.225	0.973	0.042
		0.009	0.041	0.999

PDG(2024)

Lepton mixings are large

$$|U_{PMNS}| \approx \begin{pmatrix} 0.823 & 0.548 & 0.149 \\ 0.365 & 0.651 & 0.665 \\ 0.436 & 0.525 & 0.731 \end{pmatrix}$$

NuFIT5.3(2024)

talks by Art McDonald and Mariam Tortola

Quark and lepton mixing matrices have distinctive structures!



Isidor Issac Rabi asked in 1936: Who ordered that?

Steven Weinberg: ``Asked what single mystery, if he could choose, he would like to see solved in his lifetime, Weinberg doesn't have to think for long: he wants to be able to explain the observed pattern of quark and lepton masses. ..."



Flavor symmetry approach to flavor problem

The fundamental principle of fermion masses and flavor mixing structure is unkonwn so far. Symmetry can help to reduce the number of free parameters in the Yukawa coupling.



Non-Abelian Discrete flavor symmetry



Discrete flavor symmetry approach to lepton mixing

 \succ ①Lepton mixing is fully determined by flavor symmetry G_f , i.e. $G_l > Z_2$ & $G_v > Z_2$

$$U = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{2}\cos\vartheta & 1 & -\sqrt{2}\sin\vartheta \\ -\sqrt{2}\cos(\vartheta - \pi/3) & 1 & \sqrt{2}\sin(\vartheta - \pi/3) \\ -\sqrt{2}\cos(\vartheta + \pi/3) & 1 & \sqrt{2}\sin(\vartheta + \pi/3) \end{pmatrix}$$

[Lindner et al., 1212.2411; King, Neder, Stuart, 1305.3200; Fonseca, Grimus, 1405.3678; Yao, Ding, 1505.03798; Ding, Valle, 2402.16963]

 ϑ : discrete, fixed by groups G_f , G_l , G_v _____ close to 3σ upper bounds

• Lepton mixing angles:

$$\sin^2 \theta_{12} = \sec^2 \theta_{13} / 3 \simeq 0.341,$$

$$\sin^2 \theta_{23} = \frac{1}{2} \pm \frac{1}{2} \tan \theta_{13} \sqrt{2 - \tan^2 \theta_{13}} = 0.605 \text{ or } 0.395$$

Testable at JUNO, DUNE, Hyper-K

- Dirac CP phase δ_{CP} is **conserved:** $\sin \delta_{CP} = 0$
- Larger groups required, for example |G_f|=648 for Majorana neutrinos

[Albright, Rodejohann, 0812.0436; Albright, Dueck, Rodejohann, 1004.2798; Costa, King, 2307.13895; Ding, Valle, 2402.16963]

 \geq 2 Lepton mixing is partially determined by flavor symmetry G_f , i.e. $G_l > Z_2 \& G_v = Z_2$

$$\mathbf{TM1:} \ U = \begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{\frac{2}{3}} & \times & \times \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \times & \times \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \times & \times \end{pmatrix} \quad \mathbf{TM2:} U = \begin{pmatrix} \times & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & \times \\ \times & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & \times \\ \times & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & \times \end{pmatrix} \quad \mathbf{GR2:} \ U = \begin{pmatrix} \times & \frac{s_{12}^{\nu}}{c_{12}^{\nu}} & \times \\ \times & \frac{c_{12}^{\nu}}{\sqrt{2}} & \times \\ \times & \frac{c_{12}^{\nu}}{\sqrt{2}} & \times \end{pmatrix}$$

[Costa, King, 2307.13895]

 $\tan \theta_{12}^{\nu} = 2/(1+\sqrt{5}) = 1/\phi$

8





[Petcov, 1405.6006; Ballett, King, et al, 1410.7573; Girardi,Petcov,Titov,1410.8056; Ding,Valle,2402.16963]

Symmetry origin of CP violation



[Grimus,Rebelo,hep-ph/9506272; Feruglio, Hagedorn, Ziegler, 1211.5560; Holthausen, Lindner, Schmidt,1211.6953; Chen, Fallbacher, et al., 1402.0507]

>Simplest example: $\mu\tau$ reflection = $\mu\tau$ exchange+canonical CP

$$\begin{pmatrix} v_e \\ v_{\mu} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\mu} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\mu} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\mu} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\mu} \\ v_{\tau} \\ v_{\tau$$

[Harrison, Scott, hep-ph/0210197; Grimus, Lavoura,hep-ph/0305309; Xing, Zhao, 1512.04207]

Flavor and CP symmetry to lepton mixing

Flavor + CP symmetries have rich symmetry breaking patterns, and the resulting lepton mixing matrix is determined up to few continuous free parameters.



[Ding,Valle,2402.16963]

The lepton mixing angles as well as Dirac and Majorana CP phases can be predicted by residual symmetry, neutrino masses are not constrained except in concrete models.

Universal flavor symmetry for quark and lepton mixing



- All mixing angles and CP phases are expressed in terms of two free angles θ_{l.v}∈[0,π)
- This scheme can be extended to quark sector, and the quark and lepton mixing can be described simultaneously in terms of totally four free angles.

Quark and lepton mixing from Dihedral group D_n and CP

Quark sector: $\begin{pmatrix} u_L \\ d_L \end{pmatrix} \\ \begin{pmatrix} c_L \\ s_L \end{pmatrix} \end{pmatrix} \sim 2_1, \quad \begin{pmatrix} t_L \\ b_L \end{pmatrix} \sim 1_1$ [Lu, Ding, Value [Lu, Ding, 1901.07414; Ding,Valle,2402.16963] The CKM matrix is determined as $c_{u,d} \equiv \cos \theta_{u,d}$, $s_{u,d} \equiv \sin \theta_{u,d}$ $V_{CKM} = \begin{pmatrix} -c_d \sin \varphi_1 & \cos \varphi_1 \\ c_u c_d \cos \varphi_1 + i s_u s_d & c_u \sin \varphi_1 & -c_u s_d \cos \varphi_1 + i c_d s_u \\ -c_d s_u \cos \varphi_1 + i c_u s_d & -s_u \sin \varphi_1 & s_u s_d \cos \varphi_1 + i c_u c_d \end{pmatrix}$ • Cabibbo angle from group: $\cos^2 \theta_{13}^q \sin^2 \theta_{12}^q = \cos^2 \varphi_1$

• CP phase from mixing angles: $J_{CP}^q \approx \frac{1}{2} \sin 2\varphi_1 \sin \varphi_2 \sin \theta_{13}^q \sin \theta_{23}^q$

 \succ Viable CKM matrix for $\varphi_1 = 3\pi/7$ which can be achieved in D_{14} group

	$ heta_u^{bf}/\pi$	$ heta_d^{bf}/\pi$	$\sin \theta_{12}^q$	$\sin heta_{23}^q$	$\sin \theta_{13}^q$	J^q_{CP}
Our	0.01326	0.00117	0.22252	0.04166	0.00357	3.223×10^{-5}
Data			0.22500 ± 0.00100	0.04200 ± 0.00059	0.003675 ± 0.000095	$(3.120 \pm 0.090) \times 10^{-5}$

Hierarchical quark mixing angles and irregular CP phase can be accommodated.

> Lepton sector : $\phi_1 = 2\pi/7$

Numerical benchmark

 $\begin{array}{l} \theta_l = 0.439\pi, \quad \theta_{\nu} = 0.811\pi, \quad \chi^2_{\min} = 4.147, \\ \sin^2 \theta_{13} = 0.0220, \quad \sin^2 \theta_{12} = 0.318, \quad \sin^2 \theta_{23} = 0.603, \\ \delta = 1.530\pi, \quad \alpha_{21} / \pi = 0.164 \ (\text{mod } 1), \quad \alpha_{31} / \pi = 0.112 \ (\text{mod } 1) \\ \text{Atmospheric angle } \theta_{23} > 45^\circ \text{ and nearly maximal CP violation } \delta \approx 3\pi/2 \end{array}$



quite predictive!

Testing flavor & CP symmetries

Flavor symmetry models can be ruled out by measuring symmetry protected correlations

> Precise measurements of mixing angles and CP phase



16

\succ Test neutrino mass sum rules of flavor symmetry at $0\nu\beta\beta$ decay



[Snowmass, 2203.12169]

Obstacles of flavor symmetry model building



- ▶ Realistic description of fermion masses and mixing angles requires flavor symmetry G_f be broken by Higgs-like fields "flavons" Φ_e, Φ_v etc
 - A large number of free parameters in the scalar potential
 - large shaping symmetries and many auxiliary fields

Flavor symmetry models are complicated by the symmetry breaking sector!

Modular symmetry motivated by string compactification

- a single complex flavon au parametrizing shape of torus
- Modular action

 $\tau \to \gamma \tau = \frac{a\tau + b}{c\tau + d}$

$$SL(2,Z) = \left\{ \gamma = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \middle| a, b, c, d \in \mathbb{Z}, ad - bc = 1 \right\}$$



SL(2,Z) on torus T^2

Field Non-linear transformation

 $\psi \to (c\tau + d)^{-k} \rho(\gamma) \psi$ weight $k \in \mathbb{Z} \rho$ is a unitary representation of Γ_N or Γ'_N

Superpotential

 $\mathcal{W} = \sum Y_{I_1 I_2 \dots I_n}(\tau) \psi_{I_1} \psi_{I_2} \dots \psi_{I_n}$

Yukawa coupling $Y_{I_1I_2...I_n}$ only depends on τ , and it is strongly constrained by modular invariance finite modular groups as G_f

 $G_{f} = \begin{cases} \Gamma_{N} \equiv SL(2, Z) / \pm \Gamma(N) \\ \Gamma_{N}' \equiv SL(2, Z) / \Gamma(N) \end{cases}$

Principal congruence subgroup of level N $\Gamma(N) = \{ \gamma \in SL(2, Z) \mid \gamma = 1_2 \mod N \}$

$$\Gamma_{3} \cong A_{4} \qquad \Gamma_{4} \cong S_{4} \qquad \Gamma_{4} \cong S_{4} \qquad \Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5} \qquad \Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5}$$

$$\Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5} \qquad \Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5} \qquad \Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5}$$

$$\Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5} \qquad \Gamma_{5} \cong A_{5$$

Modular invariant flavor models





Bottom-up models for lepton and quark [reviews: Kobayashi, Tanimoto, 2307.03384; Ding, King, arXiv:2311.09282]

	Γ_N/Γ'_N	leptons alone	leptons & quarks	SU(5)	SO(10)	
N = 2	S_3	Kobayashi et al, 1803.10391		Kobayashi et al, 1906.10341		
		Feruglio, 1706.08749,1807.01125;	Okada, Tanimoto, 1905.13421;	Anda King Perdamo 1812.05620:		
N = 3	A_4	Kobayashi, Tanaka, et al, 1803.10391;	King, King, 2002.00969;	Chan Ding King 2101 12794	Ding, King, Lu, 2108.09655	
N = 3		Kobayashi, Omoto, et al, 1808.03012	Yao, Lu, Ding, 2012.13390	Chen, Ding, King, 2101.12(24		
	T'	Liu, Ding,1907.01488 Lu, Liu, Ding,1912.07573		—		
	S.	Penedo, Petcov, 1806.11040;	On. Lin et al 2106 11659	Zhao, Zhang, 2101.02266;		
$N = 4$ D_4	54	Novichkov, Penedo et al, 1811.04933	Gu, Liu et al,2100.11055	Ding, King, Yao, 2103.16311		
	S'_4	Novichkov, Penedo, Petcov, 2006.03058	Liu, Yao, Ding, 2006.10722	—		
4	A	Novichkov, Penedo et al, 1812.02158;				
N = 5	.45	Ding, King, Liu, 1903.12588				
	A'_5	Wang, Yu, Zhou, 2010.10159	Yao, Liu, Ding,2011.03501	—		
$N = 6$ Γ_6 Γ'_6	Γ_6			Abe,Higaki et al, 2307.01419		
	Γ'_{6}	Li,Liu,Ding,2108.02181		—		
N = 7	Γ_7	Ding, King et al, 2004.12662		—		
n = r	Γ'_7			—		

Minimal modular lepton model

Modular symmetry allows to construct quite predictive lepton models. The modular flavor symmetry is modular binary octahedral group 20 which is the Shur double cover of S_4

	L	$E_D^c = (e^c, \mu^c)$	$ au^c$	N^c	$H_{u,d}$
2O	3	$\widehat{2}'$	1 '	3	1
k_I	-1	6	5	1	0

[Ding, Liu, Yao, 2211.04546; Ding, Liu, Lu, Weng, 2307.14926]

$$\blacktriangleright \text{Charged leptons:} \quad \mathcal{W}_E = \alpha \left(E_D^c L Y_{\widehat{\mathbf{2}}'}^{(5)} \right)_{\mathbf{1}} H_d + \beta \left(E_D^c L Y_{\widehat{\mathbf{4}}}^{(5)} \right)_{\mathbf{1}} H_d + \gamma \left(\tau^c L Y_{\mathbf{3}'}^{(4)} \right)_{\mathbf{1}} H_d$$

$$M_{E} = \begin{pmatrix} -\alpha Y_{\hat{\mathbf{2}}',2}^{(5)}(\tau) - \sqrt{2}\beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},3}^{(5)}(\tau) & \sqrt{3}\beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},1}^{(5)}(\tau) & \sqrt{2}\alpha Y_{\hat{\mathbf{2}}',1}^{(5)}(\tau) + \beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},4}^{(5)}(\tau) \\ -\alpha Y_{\hat{\mathbf{2}}',1}^{(5)}(\tau) + \sqrt{2}\beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},4}^{(5)}(\tau) & -\sqrt{2}\alpha Y_{\hat{\mathbf{2}}',2}^{(5)}(\tau) + \beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},3}^{(5)}(\tau) & -\sqrt{3}\beta Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},2}^{(5)}(\tau) \\ \gamma Y_{\mathbf{3}',1}^{(4)}(\tau) & \gamma Y_{\mathbf{3}',3}^{(4)}(\tau) & \gamma Y_{\mathbf{3}',3}^{(4)}(\tau) \end{pmatrix} v_{d}$$

> Neutrino mass (seesaw mechanism): $W_{\nu} = gH_u(N^cL)_1 + \Lambda \left(N^cN^cY_2^{(2)}\right)_1$

$$M_{D} = g \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} v_{u}, \ M_{N} = \begin{pmatrix} -2Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(2)}(\tau) & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & \sqrt{3}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(2)}(\tau) & Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(2)}(\tau) \\ 0 & Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(2)}(\tau) & \sqrt{3}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(2)}(\tau) \end{pmatrix} \Lambda$$
Minimal #p: $\alpha, \beta, \gamma, g^{2}/\Lambda$
$$M_{D} = \int_{0}^{1} \frac{1}{2} \int_{0}^{1} \frac{1}{2$$

Minimal: only 4 real couplings plus modulus τ can explain 12 observables

$$\langle \tau \rangle = -0.1921 + 1.0854i, \ \beta / \alpha = 0.7159, \ \gamma / \alpha = 87.4471,$$

$$\alpha v_d = 0.02881 \,\text{MeV}, \ g^2 v_u^2 / \Lambda = 71.8888 \,\text{meV}$$

 τ is the unique source breaking both modular and CP symmetries. All observables are within the 3σ regions, and neutrino mass spectrum is normal ordering

$$\sin^2 \theta_{12} = 0.3261, \ \sin^2 \theta_{13} = 0.02182, \ \sin^2 \theta_{23} = 0.5063, \ \delta = 1.34\pi,$$

 $\alpha_{21} = 1.3268\pi, \ \alpha_{31} = 0.5401\pi, \ m_e \ / \ m_\mu = 0.004737, \ m_\mu \ / \ m_\tau = 0.05876,$
 $m_1 = 14.27 \text{ meV}, \ m_2 = 16.67 \text{ meV}, \ m_3 = 51.64 \text{ meV}$





Summary

- > The fundamental origin of the fermion mass and mixing patterns is still elusive, neutrino provides a unique window to understand the flavor problem and explore BSM physics.
- We have learned a lot from the symmetry consideration, some illuminating and testable examples
 - Flavor and CP symmetries are powerful in constraining lepton and quark mixing parameters, in particular CP violation phases
 - Modular symmetry: enhanced predicitivity and possible connection with string theory
- > Future neutrino facilities precisely measuring lepton mixing angles, CP phase δ and $0\nu\beta\beta$ decay can exclude many models, will help to pin down the organizing principle of flavor sector.

Thank you for your attention!

Backup

Anarchy: alternative to flavor symmetry

Anarchy: No particular structure in neutrino mass matrix [Hall, Murayama, Weiner, hep-ph/9911341; $m_{\nu} \propto \begin{pmatrix} O(1) & O(1) & O(1) \\ O(1) & O(1) & O(1) \\ O(1) & O(1) & O(1) \end{pmatrix}$ each matrix element is random is random

The mixing angles and CP violation phases distributions are given by U(3) Harr distribution





- large number of O(1) free parameters→ only statistical tests
- Anarchy is not applicable to charged lepton and quark Yukawa couplings

Extending the minimal modular model to quark sector

	$Q_D = (Q_1, Q_2)$	Q_3	$U_D^c = (u^c, c^c)$	t^c	$D_D^c = (d^c, s^c)$	b^c
2O	2	1'	$\widehat{2}'$	1'	2	1'
k_I	k_{Q_D}	k_{Q_D}	$3 - k_{Q_D}$	$6 - k_{Q_D}$	$6 - k_{Q_D}$	$-k_{Q_D}$

$$M_{u} = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_{u}Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},3}^{(3)} & -\alpha_{u}Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},2}^{(3)} & 0 \\ \alpha_{u}Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},4}^{(3)} & \alpha_{u}Y_{\hat{\mathbf{4}},1}^{(3)} & 0 \\ -\beta_{u}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(6)} & \beta_{u}Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(6)} & \gamma_{u}Y_{\mathbf{1}}^{(6)} \end{pmatrix} v_{u},$$

$$M_{d} = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_{d}Y_{\mathbf{1}}^{(6)} - \gamma_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(6)} & \beta_{d}Y_{\mathbf{1}'}^{(6)} + \gamma_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(6)} & -\delta_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(6)} \\ \gamma_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},2}^{(6)} - \beta_{d}Y_{\mathbf{1}'}^{(6)} & \alpha_{d}Y_{\mathbf{1}}^{(6)} + \gamma_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(6)} & \delta_{d}Y_{\mathbf{2},1}^{(6)} \\ 0 & 0 & \varepsilon_{d} \end{pmatrix} v_{d}$$

The complex modulus τ is common in both quark and lepton sectors, and its value is fixed by the lepton parameters $\langle \tau \rangle = -0.1946 + 1.0799i$

The quark masses and CKM mixing parameters can be well accommodated with $\chi_q^2 = 6.4$:

$$\theta_{12}^q = 0.229, \quad \theta_{13}^q = 0.00393, \quad \theta_{23}^q = 0.0388, \quad \delta_{CP}^q = 61.27^\circ,$$

 $m_u / m_c = 0.00243, m_c / m_t = 0.00245, m_d / m_s = 0.0510, m_s / m_b = 0.0234$

 The model uses 14 parameters to describe the masses and mixing of both quark and lepton sectors: 12 masses+6 mixing angles+4 CP phases.

Unification of flavor, CP and modular symmetries

- Top-down approach (orbifold string compactification) gives \succ
 - Normal symmetries of extra dimensions \rightarrow traditional flavor symmetries ٠
 - String duality transformations → modular flavor symmetries •
 - CP symmetry ٠



> Top-down and bottom-up approaches do not yet meet, and model building in its infancy

[Nilles, Ramos-Sanchez,

2004.05200]

Vaudrevange, 2001.01736;

Tests of modulus couplings

