The spectrum of Asymptotic Safety from $2+\varepsilon$ gravity

Riccardo Martini

I.N.F.N.- Sezione di Pisa

Based on collaborations with O. Zanusso, A. Ugolotti, F. Del Porro, D. Sauro: arXiv 2103.12421, 2302.14804

UV Complete Quantum Field Theories for Particle Physics, 2023, San Miniato

September 5th, 2023



Motivation I

• Original formulation of asymptotic safety [Weinberg, 1979] based on results in gravity close to d = 2



Credit: H. Gies

Motivation I

• Original formulation of asymptotic safety [Weinberg, 1979] based on results in gravity close to d = 2



credit: Reuter & Saueressig, 2001



Credit: H. Gies

First application of non-perturbative RG flow to test the conjecture in d = 4 [Reuter, 1998]
Non-perturmative computations based on Functional renormalization group [Wetterich, 1993; Morris, 1993]

Motivations: II

Functional Renormalization Group cons:

- Theory space is infinitely dimensional \rightarrow need of truncation
- Strong regulator and scheme dependence
- Gauge dependent results

Motivations: II

Functional Renormalization Group cons:

- Theory space is infinitely dimensional \rightarrow need of truncation
- Strong regulator and scheme dependence
- Gauge dependent results

Physics lies in on-shell observables

- imposing equations of motion along the RG flow \bullet
 - Essential Renormalization Group •

[Weinberg, 1979; Benedetti, 2011; Anselmi, 2013; Baldazzi, Zinati, Falls; 2021]

Motivations: II

Functional Renormalization Group cons:

- \bullet Theory space is infinitely dimensional \rightarrow need of truncation
- Strong regulator and scheme dependence
- Gauge dependent results

Physics lies in on-shell observables

imposing equations of motion along the RG flow \bullet

Essential Renormalization Group •

[Weinberg, 1979; Benedetti, 2011; Anselmi, 2013; Baldazzi, Zinati, Falls; 2021]

Revise perturbative methods

• Revise perturbative computations in $d = 2 + \varepsilon$

• Does the analytic continuation $d = 2 \rightarrow 4$ interpolate higher derivative gravity? [Stelle, 1976; Fradkin & Tseyling, 1982; Avramidi & Barvinsky, 1985...] How to identify universality classes?

- Identify the symmetries of the system
- Identify a critical dimension d_c
- At d_c the perturbative expansion of the theory is controlled by a set of marginal operators.
- Require possible analytic continuation in some dimensional range

For a metric field content one has:

$$\mathcal{O} \sim \mathcal{R}^n \qquad d_c = 2n$$
.

- $d_c = 2$ Kawai-Ninomiya universality class Kawai, Ninomiya, Aida, Kitazawa, Nishimura, Tsuchiya, ..., 1993-1997
- $d_c = 4$ Stelle universality class Stelle, 1976
- $d_c = 6$ Cubic gravity Knorr, 2021

Consider a massive scalar ϕ^4 -theory in 4-dimensions

$$\mu^{4-d} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^d k}{k^2 + m^2} = \mu^{4-d} (\pi m^2)^{d/2} \Gamma\left(1 - \frac{d}{2}\right)$$

Consider a massive scalar ϕ^4 -theory in 4-dimensions

$$\mu^{4-d} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^d k}{k^2 + m^2} = \mu^{4-d} (\pi m^2)^{d/2} \Gamma\left(1 - \frac{d}{2}\right)$$

Expanding in $\varepsilon = 4 - d$ one finds the following mapping between cut-off divergences and ε -poles

$$\log \Lambda \leftrightarrow \frac{1}{\varepsilon}$$
$$\Lambda^2 \leftrightarrow 0$$
$$\Lambda^4 \leftrightarrow 0$$

Consider a massive scalar ϕ^4 -theory in 4-dimensions

$$\mu^{4-d} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^d k}{k^2 + m^2} = \mu^{4-d} (\pi m^2)^{d/2} \Gamma\left(1 - \frac{d}{2}\right)$$

Expanding in $\varepsilon = 4 - d$ one finds the following mapping between cut-off divergences and ε -poles

$$\log \Lambda \leftrightarrow \frac{1}{\varepsilon}$$

$$\Lambda^2 \leftrightarrow \qquad \frac{\mu^2}{\varepsilon^{(1)}}$$

$$\Lambda^4 \leftrightarrow$$

Consider a massive scalar ϕ^4 -theory in 4-dimensions

$$\mu^{4-d} \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^d k}{k^2 + m^2} = \mu^{4-d} (\pi m^2)^{d/2} \Gamma\left(1 - \frac{d}{2}\right)$$

Expanding in $\varepsilon = 4 - d$ one finds the following mapping between cut-off divergences and ε -poles

$$\log \Lambda \leftrightarrow \qquad \frac{1}{\varepsilon^{L}} \\ \Lambda^{2} \leftrightarrow \qquad \frac{\mu^{2}}{\varepsilon^{(L)}} \\ \Lambda^{4} \leftrightarrow \qquad \frac{\mu^{4}}{\varepsilon^{(L)}} \text{ (vacuum diagrams)}$$

where $\varepsilon^{(L)} = 4 - \frac{2}{L} - d$ and $\overline{\varepsilon}^{(L)} = 4 - \frac{4}{L} - d$. [Al-sarhi, Jack, Jones; '90-'91]

The theory can be made finite for **all** dimensions d < 4.

2d Gravity: an old puzzle

Linear splitting (ex. Jack and Jones, 1990) (ex. .

Exponential splitting (ex. Aida, Kitazawa, Kawai, Ninomiya, 1994)

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu}$$
$$g_{\mu\nu} = \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu}\varphi^{\frac{4}{d-2}} = \bar{g}_{\mu\rho} \left(e^{h}\right)_{\nu}^{\rho}\varphi^{\frac{4}{d-2}}$$

$$S_E[g] = \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{g} \Big\{ g_0 - g_1 R \Big\}$$

central charge = 19

$$\beta_G = \varepsilon G - \frac{19}{24\pi} G^2$$

$$\left\langle T^{\mu}_{\mu} \right\rangle \stackrel{\varepsilon \to 0}{=} \beta_G = ?$$

$$\begin{split} S_D[\varphi, \tilde{g}] &= -g_1 \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\tilde{g}} \Big\{ \varphi^2 \tilde{R} + \frac{1}{\xi_c} \tilde{g}^{\mu\nu} \partial_\mu \varphi \partial_\nu \varphi \Big\} \\ &+ g_0 \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\tilde{g}} \varphi^{\frac{2d}{d-2}} \end{split}$$

$$\xi_c = \frac{d-2}{4(d-1)} \Rightarrow \text{central charge} = 25$$

$$\beta_G = \varepsilon G - \frac{25}{24\pi} G^2$$

2d Gravity: an old puzzle

Linear splitting (ex. Jack and Jones, 1990) (ex. A

Exponential splitting (ex. Aida, Kitazawa, Kawai, Ninomiya, 1994)

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu}$$
$$g_{\mu\nu} = \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu}\varphi^{\frac{4}{d-2}} = \bar{g}_{\mu\rho} \left(e^{h}\right)^{\rho}_{\nu}\varphi^{\frac{4}{d-2}}$$

$$S_E[g] = \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{g} \Big\{ g_0 - g_1 R \Big\}$$

central charge = 19

$$\beta_G = \varepsilon G - \frac{19}{24\pi} G^2$$

$$\left\langle T^{\mu}_{\mu} \right\rangle \stackrel{\varepsilon \to 0}{=} \beta_G = ?$$

$$\begin{split} S_D[\varphi, \tilde{g}] &= -g_1 \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\tilde{g}} \Big\{ \varphi^2 \tilde{R} + \frac{1}{\xi_c} \tilde{g}^{\mu\nu} \partial_\mu \varphi \partial_\nu \varphi \Big\} \\ &+ g_0 \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\tilde{g}} \varphi^{\frac{2d}{d-2}} + q \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\tilde{g}} \varphi \tilde{R} \end{split}$$

$$\xi_c = \frac{d-2}{4(d-1)} \Rightarrow \text{central charge} = 25$$

$$\beta_G = \varepsilon G - \frac{25}{24\pi} G^2$$

Einstein-Hilbert gravity

Consider the Einstein-Hilbert action

$$S_{EH}[g] = \int d^d x \sqrt{g} \ (g_0 - g_1 R)$$

Diffeomorphism-invariance plays the role of a gauge symmetry: $\delta_{\zeta}g_{\mu\nu} = \nabla_{\mu}\zeta_{\nu} + \nabla_{\nu}\zeta_{\mu}$ We look at the parametrization dependence

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \overline{g}_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} + \frac{\lambda}{2} h_{\mu\rho} \overline{g}^{\rho\theta} h_{\theta\nu} + \mathcal{O}(h^3)$$

and gauge dependence of the 1-loop divergences: $\delta_{\zeta}h_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\rho}\bar{\nabla}_{\nu}\zeta^{\rho} + \bar{g}_{\nu\rho}\bar{\nabla}_{\mu}\zeta^{\rho} + o(h)$

$$S_{gf}[h;\bar{g}] = \frac{1}{2} \int d^d x \sqrt{\bar{g}} \ \bar{g}^{\mu\nu} F_{\mu} F_{\nu} ,$$
$$F_{\mu} = \bar{\nabla}_{\rho} h^{\rho}_{\mu} - \frac{1 + \delta\xi}{2} \bar{\nabla}_{\mu} h^{\rho}_{\rho} ,$$
$$S_{gh}[h,c,\bar{c};\bar{g}] = \int d^d x \sqrt{\bar{g}} \ \bar{c}^{\mu} \delta_{\zeta} F_{\mu}|_{\zeta \to c}$$

Dimensions as symmetry parameter

In d = 2 we have a discontinuity in the number of the degrees of freedom

$$\frac{\delta^2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu} \delta h_{\alpha\beta}} \left(S_{EH} + S_{gf} \right) = -K^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} \nabla^2 + E^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} ,$$
$$K^{-1}_{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \left(g_{\mu\alpha} g_{\nu\beta} + g_{\mu\beta} g_{\nu\alpha} - \frac{1}{d-2} g_{\mu\nu} g_{\alpha\beta} \right)$$

The kinematic pole enters the structure of subdivergences in the loop expansion

Dimensions as symmetry parameter

In d = 2 we have a discontinuity in the number of the degrees of freedom

$$\frac{\delta^2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu} \delta h_{\alpha\beta}} \left(S_{EH} + S_{gf} \right) = -K^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} \nabla^2 + E^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} ,$$
$$K^{-1}_{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \left(g_{\mu\alpha} g_{\nu\beta} + g_{\mu\beta} g_{\nu\alpha} - \frac{1}{d-2} g_{\mu\nu} g_{\alpha\beta} \right)$$

The kinematic pole enters the structure of subdivergences in the loop expansion

Modified dimensional regularization

$$\int \mathrm{d}^2 x = \mu^{-\varepsilon} \int \mathrm{d}^d x \qquad \qquad g^{\mu}_{\mu} = d \neq 2 - \varepsilon$$

Dimensions as symmetry parameter

In d = 2 we have a discontinuity in the number of the degrees of freedom

$$\frac{\delta^2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu} \delta h_{\alpha\beta}} \left(S_{EH} + S_{gf} \right) = -K^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} \nabla^2 + E^{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} ,$$
$$K^{-1}_{\mu\nu\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \left(g_{\mu\alpha} g_{\nu\beta} + g_{\mu\beta} g_{\nu\alpha} - \frac{1}{d-2} g_{\mu\nu} g_{\alpha\beta} \right)$$

The kinematic pole enters the structure of subdivergences in the loop expansion

Modified dimensional regularization

$$\int \mathrm{d}^2 x = \mu^{-\varepsilon} \int \mathrm{d}^d x \qquad \qquad g^{\mu}_{\mu} = d \neq 2 - \varepsilon$$

d in Diff (\mathcal{M}_d) has a similar role to N in SU(N) gauge theories

On-shell divergences



The 1-loop divergences in $d = 2 - \varepsilon$ can be arranged in the following way

$$\Gamma_{\rm div}^{1-loop}[0;\bar{g}] = \frac{\mu^{-\varepsilon}}{\varepsilon} \int d^d x \sqrt{\bar{g}} \left\{ A\bar{R} + J_{\mu\nu} \left(\overline{G}^{\mu\nu} + \frac{g_0}{2g_1} \overline{g}^{\mu\nu} \right) \right\},$$

$$A = \frac{36 + 3d - d^2}{48\pi}, \qquad J_{\mu\nu} = \frac{\overline{g}_{\mu\nu}}{4\pi} \left\{ \frac{d^2 - d - 4}{2(d - 2)} \lambda - \delta\xi \left(2 + \frac{2\lambda}{d - 2} \right) - d - 1 \right\}$$

And the consequent β -function for $G_N = \frac{1}{g_1}$ is [Falls, 2015; R.M. et al., 2021; Bastianelli et al., 2022]

$$\beta_G = \varepsilon G - \frac{36 + 3d - d^2}{48\pi} G^2 \quad \rightarrow \quad \beta_G = -\frac{19}{24\pi} G^2$$

$$G^* = -\frac{48\pi(d-2)}{d^2 - 3d - 36}$$
 for $d \lesssim 7.6$

The dilaton realization

We can repeat the same analysis for unimodular-dilaton action and postulate

$$\Gamma_{\rm div}[0,0;\bar{g},\bar{\varphi}] = \frac{\mu^{-\varepsilon}}{\varepsilon} \int d^d x \sqrt{\bar{g}} \left\{ B\bar{R} + Je \right\}$$

e being the e.o.m. for $\bar{\varphi}.$ However

$$\begin{split} B &= -\frac{11d^4 - 44d^3 - 78d^2 + 180d - 72}{96\pi d(d-1)} \\ &- \frac{(d-2)(18d^5 - 35d^4 - 132d^3 + 152d^2 + 48d - 48)}{192\pi d^3(d-1)} \delta\beta ,\\ J &= -\frac{3d^3 - 6d^2 - 12d + 16}{8\pi d} - \frac{(d-2)(3d^2 - 4)(2d^2 + d - 2)}{16\pi d^3} \delta\beta \end{split}$$

10/14

The dilaton realization

We can repeat the same analysis for unimodular-dilaton action and postulate

$$\Gamma_{\rm div}[0,0;\bar{g},\bar{\varphi}] = \frac{\mu^{-\varepsilon}}{\varepsilon} \int \mathrm{d}^d x \sqrt{\bar{g}} \left\{ B\bar{R} + Je \right\}$$

e being the e.o.m. for $\bar{\varphi}.$ However

$$\begin{split} B &= -\frac{11d^4 - 44d^3 - 78d^2 + 180d - 72}{96\pi d(d-1)} \\ &- \frac{(d-2)(18d^5 - 35d^4 - 132d^3 + 152d^2 + 48d - 48)}{192\pi d^3(d-1)} \delta\beta ,\\ J &= -\frac{3d^3 - 6d^2 - 12d + 16}{8\pi d} - \frac{(d-2)(3d^2 - 4)(2d^2 + d - 2)}{16\pi d^3} \delta\beta \end{split}$$

- Not suitable for continuation away from d = 2.
- As $d \to 2$ the volume operator $\lambda(\varphi)$ has a trivial scaling
- The topological charge has a non-trivial running proportional to (d-2)
- As $d \to 2$ we recover the known result $\beta_G = -\frac{25}{24\pi}G^2$
- Choosing the scheme where e.o.m. are solved for the volume operator we recover $\beta_G = -\frac{19}{24\pi}G^2$

Deformation of Einstein-Hilbert theory

Include higher derivative operators as composite:

$$S_{\rm hd}[g] = \int d^d x \sqrt{g} \Big\{ \alpha_1 R^2_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \alpha_2 R^2 + I_{2,\mu\nu} E[g]^{\mu\nu} \Big\} \equiv -\overrightarrow{\alpha} \cdot \mathcal{R}_2$$
$$I_{2,\mu\nu} = \alpha_3 R g_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_4 R_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_5 \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} \,.$$

Deformation of Einstein-Hilbert theory

Include higher derivative operators as composite:

$$S_{\rm hd}[g] = \int d^d x \sqrt{g} \Big\{ \alpha_1 R^2_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \alpha_2 R^2 + I_{2,\mu\nu} E[g]^{\mu\nu} \Big\} \equiv -\overrightarrow{\alpha} \cdot \mathcal{R}_2$$
$$I_{2,\mu\nu} = \alpha_3 R g_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_4 R_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_5 \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} \,.$$

Divergences of effective action for the composite operator

$$\Gamma_{\infty}[0,\alpha;\bar{g}] = -\overrightarrow{\alpha} \left[\frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} \frac{\delta^2 \mathcal{R}_2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu} \delta h_{\rho\sigma}} G_{\rho\sigma\mu\nu} - \frac{g_1}{\varepsilon} J_{\mu\nu} \frac{\delta \mathcal{R}_2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu}} \right]_{h=0}$$

Deformation of Einstein-Hilbert theory

Include higher derivative operators as composite:

$$S_{\rm hd}[g] = \int d^d x \sqrt{g} \Big\{ \alpha_1 R^2_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \alpha_2 R^2 + I_{2,\mu\nu} E[g]^{\mu\nu} \Big\} \equiv -\overrightarrow{\alpha} \cdot \mathcal{R}_2$$
$$I_{2,\mu\nu} = \alpha_3 R g_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_4 R_{\mu\nu} + \alpha_5 \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} \,.$$

Divergences of effective action for the composite operator

$$\Gamma_{\infty}[0,\alpha;\bar{g}] = -\overrightarrow{\alpha} \left[\frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} \frac{\delta^2 \mathcal{R}_2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu} \delta h_{\rho\sigma}} G_{\rho\sigma\mu\nu} - \frac{g_1}{\varepsilon} J_{\mu\nu} \frac{\delta \mathcal{R}_2}{\delta h_{\mu\nu}} \right]_{h=0}$$

Reduce the system to only two operators with the aid of e.o.m.s



Special cases: d = 2, 3

In d = 2 one has the following identities

$$R_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} = \frac{R}{2} (g_{\mu\rho}g_{\nu\sigma} - g_{\mu\sigma}g_{\nu\rho}), \quad R_{\mu\nu} = \frac{R}{2}g_{\mu\nu}$$

because of which α_1 and α_2 are not independent. Therefore

$$\beta_2^{d=2} = (\beta_1 + \beta_2)_{\alpha_1 = 0}^{d->2}$$

We find the classical scaling for α_2 : $\theta = -2$.

Special cases: d = 2, 3

In d = 2 one has the following identities

$$R_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} = \frac{R}{2} (g_{\mu\rho}g_{\nu\sigma} - g_{\mu\sigma}g_{\nu\rho}), \quad R_{\mu\nu} = \frac{R}{2}g_{\mu\nu}$$

because of which α_1 and α_2 are not independent. Therefore

$$\beta_2^{d=2} = (\beta_1 + \beta_2)_{\alpha_1 = 0}^{d - > 2}$$

We find the classical scaling for α_2 : $\theta = -2$.

In d = 3

$$R_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}R^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} = 4R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu} - R^2$$

and we have to consider

$$\beta_2^{d=3} = (-\beta_1 + \beta_2)_{\alpha_1 = 0}^{d->3}$$

with critical exponent $\theta = -\frac{49}{108}$.

Conclusions and Outlook

Conclusions:

- Non trivial flow for G_N from poles in $d \to 2$
- finite size conformal window for the UV-fixed point
- \bullet Dilaton realization not suitable for analytic continuation $d \to 4$
- One relevant operator of order $\sim \mathcal{R}^2$

Conclusions and Outlook

Conclusions:

- Non trivial flow for G_N from poles in $d \to 2$
- finite size conformal window for the UV-fixed point
- \bullet Dilaton realization not suitable for analytic continuation $d \to 4$
- One relevant operator of order $\sim \mathcal{R}^2$

Outlook

- Test gauge dependence of composite operators
- Inspect $\sim \mathcal{R}^3$ operators
- \bullet Two-loop computations of Einstein-Hilbert gravity in $d=2+\varepsilon$ to prove renormalizability

Thank you!

Wave function renormalization

Given an action S[g] for a field g_x over a background \bar{g}_x we have the functionals

$$Z[j;\bar{g}] = e^{W[j;\bar{g}]} = \int \mathcal{D}h \exp\left\{-S[\bar{g}+h] + j_x h_x\right\},$$

$$\Gamma[H;\bar{g}] = j_x[H]H_x - W[j[H]] \quad \text{with} \quad H_x \equiv \frac{\delta W[j]}{\delta J_x} = \langle h_x \rangle_c$$

One loop approximation close to some critical dimension $d = d_c - \varepsilon$

$$\frac{1}{2}\operatorname{Tr}\log\bar{S}^{\prime\prime} = -\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{S}_x^{\prime} + \frac{1}{\varepsilon}\Delta\Gamma_{\infty} + \Delta\Gamma_f$$

$$\Gamma[H;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} + \bar{S}'_x \left(H_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x \right) + \frac{1}{2} H_x \bar{S}''_{xy} H_y + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

However $j_x[H] = 0 \Leftrightarrow H_x = -G_{xy}\bar{S}'_y \stackrel{\text{o.s.}}{=} 0$

$$\Gamma[0;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} - \bar{S}'_x \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

Field redefinition

Change variable $\tilde{h}_x = h_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x$ and add the counterterm

$$Z_R[j;\bar{g}] = e^{\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\Delta\Gamma_{\infty}} \int \mathcal{D}\tilde{h} \exp\left\{-S\left[\bar{g}+\tilde{h}+\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}\right]+j_x\tilde{h}_x\right\}$$

We can read the renormalized equations of motion from the relation between j_x and \hat{H}_x

$$j_x[\tilde{H}] = \bar{S}_{xy}''\tilde{H}_y + \bar{S}_x' + \frac{1}{\varepsilon}\bar{S}_{xy}''\mathcal{J}_x$$

leading to

Composite operators

We are interested in computing the expectation value of an operator O[g]

$$\begin{aligned} \langle O[g] \rangle &\equiv \int \mathcal{D}h \; O[\bar{g}+h] \exp\left\{-S[\bar{g}+h] + j_x h_x\right\} \\ &= \left. \frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} \right|_{\alpha=0} \int \mathcal{D}h \; \exp\left\{-S[\bar{g}+h] + \alpha O[\bar{g}+h] + j_x h_x\right\} \equiv \left. \frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} \right|_{\alpha=0} \exp\{W[j,\alpha;\bar{g}]\} \end{aligned}$$

define

$$\Gamma[H,\alpha;\bar{g}] = H_x j_x - W[j,\alpha;\bar{g}] \quad \Rightarrow \quad \langle O[\bar{g}+h] \rangle = -\left. \frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} \right|_{\alpha=0} \Gamma[j^{-1}[0],\alpha,\bar{g}]$$

Effectively the action is shifted $A[g]=S[g]-\alpha O[g]$

$$\frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} \log A'' = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Tr} \log \left(\bar{S}'' - \alpha \bar{O}'' \right) = -\frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x \bar{S}'_x + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma^O_\infty + \Delta \Gamma^O_f ,$$
$$\Gamma[H, \alpha; \bar{g}] = \swarrow + \checkmark$$

$$j_x[H] = \left(\bar{S}_{xy}^{\prime\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_{xy}^{\prime\prime}\right) H_y + \bar{S}_x^{\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_x^{\prime} \,,$$

leading to

$$\Gamma[H,\alpha;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} - \alpha \bar{O} + (H_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x) \bar{S}'_x - \alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x + \frac{1}{2} H_x \left(\bar{S}''_{xy} - \alpha \bar{O}''_{xy} \right) H_y + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma^O_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

$$j_x[H] = \left(\bar{S}_{xy}^{\prime\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_{xy}^{\prime\prime}\right) H_y + \bar{S}_x^{\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_x^{\prime} \,,$$

leading to

$$\Gamma[H,\alpha;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} - \alpha \bar{O} + (H_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x) \bar{S}'_x - \alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x + \frac{1}{2} H_x \left(\bar{S}''_{xy} - \alpha \bar{O}''_{xy} \right) H_y + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma^O_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

• $H[0] = j^{-1}[0] = 0 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \bar{S}'_x = \alpha \bar{O}'_x$

Then $-\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{S}' \to -\frac{\alpha}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{O}'$ new counterterm to include

$$j_x[H] = \left(\bar{S}_{xy}^{\prime\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_{xy}^{\prime\prime}\right) H_y + \bar{S}_x^{\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_x^{\prime} \,,$$

leading to

$$\Gamma[H,\alpha;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} - \alpha \bar{O} + (H_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x) \bar{S}'_x - \alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x + \frac{1}{2} H_x \left(\bar{S}''_{xy} - \alpha \bar{O}''_{xy} \right) H_y + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma^O_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

• $H[0] = j^{-1}[0] = 0 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \bar{S}'_x = \alpha \bar{O}'_x$

Then $-\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{S}' \to -\frac{\alpha}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{O}'$ new counterterm to include • Shift H_x as before to take care of \mathcal{J}_x

Then $-\alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x \to -\alpha \tilde{H}_x \bar{O}'_x - \frac{\alpha}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x \bar{O}'$ new counterterm

$$j_x[H] = \left(\bar{S}_{xy}^{\prime\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_{xy}^{\prime\prime}\right) H_y + \bar{S}_x^{\prime} - \alpha \bar{O}_x^{\prime} \,,$$

leading to

$$\Gamma[H,\alpha;\bar{g}] = \bar{S} - \alpha \bar{O} + (H_x - \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x) \bar{S}'_x - \alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x + \frac{1}{2} H_x \left(\bar{S}''_{xy} - \alpha \bar{O}''_{xy} \right) H_y + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \Delta \Gamma^O_\infty + \Delta \Gamma_f$$

• $H[0] = j^{-1}[0] = 0 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \bar{S}'_x = \alpha \bar{O}'_x$

Then $-\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{S}' \to -\frac{\alpha}{\varepsilon}\mathcal{J}_x\bar{O}'$ new counterterm to include • Shift H_x as before to take care of \mathcal{J}_x

Then $-\alpha H_x \bar{O}'_x \to -\alpha \tilde{H}_x \bar{O}'_x - \frac{\alpha}{\varepsilon} \mathcal{J}_x \bar{O}'$ new counterterm $\frac{\langle O \rangle}{\langle 1 \rangle} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} \Gamma_R[0,\alpha;\bar{g}] \Big|_{\alpha=0} = \bar{O} + \frac{1}{2\varepsilon^2} \mathcal{J}_x \bar{O}''_{xy} \mathcal{J}_y - \frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} \Delta \Gamma_f^O \Big|_{\alpha=0}$ $\bar{S}'_x + \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \bar{S}''_{xy} \mathcal{J}_x = 0$

Riccardo Martini (INFN)