

20th International Conference on Hadron Spectroscopy and Structure



RHINE UNIVER

Università degli Studi di Ferrara Isabella Garzia University of Ferrara and INFN On behalf of the **№SII** Collaboration





The BESIII experiment @ BEPCII



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

Hadron Spectrum

Hadron spectroscopy: establish the spectrum and study the exotic hadrons properties



A lot of exotic states observed experimentally, but their nature is still far from being understood!!!





Light hadron physics

- Meson and baryon spectroscopy
- Glueballs and hybrids

•

Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

New discoveries at BESIII



Date of arXiv submission

Manifestly exotic

- Quark contents more than $q\overline{q}$ or qqq
- Quantum number J^{PC} not reachable for ordinary mesons or baryons

'Cryptoexotic' exotic

- overpopulation of states
- mass/width not fitting in spectra
- production and/or decay patterns incompatible with standard mesons/baryons

BESIII dataset and physics program



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

Hunting for glueballs and new forms of hadrons

Charmonium radiative decays is the ideal laboratory for light glueballs and hybrids hadron studies (clean, high statistics and gluon-rich process)



Hunting for glueballs and new forms of hadrons

Charmonium radiative decays is the ideal laboratory for light glueballs and hybrids hadron studies (clean, high statistics and gluon-rich process)
 <u>Prediction from LQCD</u>



Observation of Exotic Isoscalar State $\eta_1(1855)$ in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta'$



J/ψ radiative decay: PWA status in a nutshell

*lightest glueball candidates

	0+	2+	0-	
Ϳ/ψ→γΡΡ	$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma\eta\eta$ (PRI $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma\pi^0\pi^0$ (PR $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K_S K_S$ (PR $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma\eta\eta'$ (PRI $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma\eta'\eta'$ (PRI	D87,092009) D92,052003) RD98,072003) .129,192002) D105,072002)		
${ m J}/\psi{ m ightarrow}\gamma{ m V}{ m V}$		$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \omega \phi \text{ (PRD87,032008)}$ J/ψ $\rightarrow \gamma \phi \phi \text{ (PRD93,112011)}$ J/ψ $\rightarrow \gamma \omega \omega \text{ (PRD100,052012)}$		
J/ψ→γΡΡΡ			$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta' \pi \pi \text{ (PRL106,072002,} \\ \text{noPWA)}$ $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K_S K_S \eta \text{ (PRL115,091803)} \\ J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K_S K_S \pi^0 \text{ (JHEP 03,121)}$	

- $J/\psi \to \gamma PP: 0^{++}, 2^{++}, ...$
- $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma PPP$, γVV : 0^{-+}
- Neutral channel is much cleaner than the charged ones

Amplitude Analysis: toll to extract the complex amplitudes from experimental data

- Models with free parameters
- Consider the kinematic of final states particles
- Vary the parameters to maximize the likelihood

- Mass Dependent (MD) PWA: model the dynamics of particle interactions as coherent sum of resonances
- Mass Independent (MI) PWA: make minimal model assumptions and measure the dynamical amplitudes independently in small regions of two-meson invariant mass (JHEP 03,121 (2023))

Partial Wave Analysis of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta' \eta'$

PWA of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta' \eta'$ using 10 Billion of J/ψ data @ BESIII > $\eta' \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- / \eta \pi^+ \pi^- (\eta \rightarrow \gamma \gamma)$

 decay width of scalar glueball to η'η' should be comparable to that of scalar glueball to ηη



> $J^{PC} = 0^{++}, 2^{++}, 4^{++}$ in $\eta' \eta'$ > $J^{PC} = 1^{+-}, 1^{--}$ in

γη'



PRD 105, 072002(2022)

Partial Wave Analysis of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta' \eta'$

PRD 105, 072002(2022)

Resonance	$M(MeV/c^2)$	$\Gamma(MeV)$	B.F.	Significance (σ)
$f_0(2020)$	$1982 \pm 3^{+54}_{-0}$	$436 \pm 4^{+46}_{-49}$	$(2.63 \pm 0.06^{+0.31}_{-0.46}) \times 10^{-4}$	≫25 Dominant
$f_0(2330)$	$2312 \pm 2^{+10}_{-0}$	$134 \pm 5^{+30}_{-9}$	$(6.09 \pm 0.64^{+4.00}_{-1.68}) \times 10^{-6}$	16.3 contributions
$f_0(2480)$	$2470\pm4^{+4}_{-6}$	$75\pm9^{+11}_{-8}$	$(8.18 \pm 1.77^{+3.73}_{-2.23}) \times 10^{-7}$	5.2 new 0 ⁺⁺ state
$h_1(1415)$	$1384\pm6^{+9}_{-0}$	$66 \pm 10^{+12}_{-10}$	$(4.69 \pm 0.80^{+0.74}_{-1.82}) \times 10^{-7}$	5.3
$f_2(2340)$	$2346\pm8^{+22}_{-6}$	$332 \pm 14^{+26}_{-12}$	$(8.67 \pm 0.70^{+0.61}_{-1.67}) \times 10^{-6}$	16.1
0 ⁺⁺ PHSP	••••	•••	$(1.17 \pm 0.23^{+4.09}_{-0.70}) \times 10^{-5}$	15.7

Only component with significance larger than 5σ

- $f_0(2020)$, $f_0(2330)$ and $f_2(2340)$ observed in $\eta'\eta'$ decay mode for the first time
- $f_0(2480)$: new 0⁺⁺ state observed

f₀(2020):

- production compatible with that of $f_0(2100)$ in J/ $\psi \rightarrow \gamma\eta\eta$ [PRD87, 092009(2013)] and $f_0(2200)$ in J/ $\psi \rightarrow \gamma K_S^0 K_S^0$ [PRD98, 072003(2018)]
 - its large production rate in radiative J/ ψ decay suggest a large overlap with scalar glueball
 - consistent with previous analysis results, but its mass is lower than the mass of the first excitation of scalar glueball from the LQCD prediction (Phys. Lett. B 309, 378, Phys. Rev. D 60, 034509)

Partial Wave Analysis of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^0{}_S K^0{}_S \pi^0$



 $M(K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0) < 1.6 \text{ GeV/c}^2$



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

JHEP03(2023)121

$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^{0}{}_{S}K^{0}{}_{S}\pi^{0}$ - Mass Dependent PWA

* full table link

(**1320)⁰**π⁰

1.35

1.4

1.45

1.5

1.55

→ K (892)⁰K_s⁰

 $\rightarrow a_0(980)^0 \pi^0$

2⁺⁺→ K (892)⁰K_S

2⁻⁺→ a₀(980)⁰π⁰

1.3

Data

14000

12000

10000

8000

6000

4000

2000

1.25

Events/(0.015GeV/c²)

×



Solution Masses and widths of intermediate states from J/ψ radiative decay are floating in the

fit (all the other resonances fixed)

 0⁻⁺ component: two isoscalar states using relativistic BW model

Resonance	$M({ m MeV}/c^2)$	$\Gamma({ m MeV})$
$\eta(1405)$	$1391.7\pm0.7^{+11.3}_{-0.3}$	$60.8 \pm 1.2^{+5.5}_{-12.0}$
$\eta(1475)$	$1507.6 \pm 1.6^{+15.5}_{-32.2}$	$115.8\pm2.4^{+14.8}_{-10.9}$
$f_1(1285)$	$1280.2\pm0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5}$	$28.2 \pm 1.1^{+5.5}_{-2.9}$
$f_1(1420)$	$1433.5 \pm 1.1^{+27.9}_{-0.7}$	$95.9 \pm 2.3^{+13.6}_{-10.9}$
$f_2(1525)$	$1515.4 \pm 2.5^{+3.2}_{-7.6}$	$64.0\pm4.3^{+2.0}_{-6.1}$



1.6

 (\mathbf{a})

$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$ - Mass Independent PWA

- Mass independent fit by scanning the invariant $K_{S}^{0}K_{S}^{0}\pi^{0}$ mass
 - identification of the strongest waves
- > The pseudoscalar component is the dominant contribution
 - \blacktriangleright relatively constant around 1.4 GeV/c²
 - \succ (K⁰_SK⁰_S)_{S-wave} π^0 and (K⁰_S π^0)_{P-wave}K⁰_S partial waves are of comparable magnitude, but with different lineshape and peaks
 - two resonances parameterization needed
 - Triangle Singularity Mechanism cannot describe data well



$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^{0}{}_{S}K^{0}{}_{S}\pi^{0}$ - Mass Independent PWA

- Mass independent fit by scanning the invariant K⁰_SK⁰_Sπ⁰ mass
 - identification of the strongest waves
- The pseudoscalar component is the dominant contribution
 - ➤ relatively constant around 1.4 GeV/c²
 - (K⁰_SK⁰_S)_{S-wave}π⁰ and (K⁰_Sπ⁰)_{P-wave}K⁰_S partial waves are of comparable magnitude, but with different lineshape and peaks
 - two resonances parameterization needed
 - Triangle Singularity Mechanism cannot describe data well
- Axial vector component peaking at 1.28 GeV/c² and 1.42 GeV/c²
- Tensor component around 1.52 GeV/c² decaying into K*(892)⁰K⁰_S observed for the first time
- Consistency between MI and MD results

Isabella Garzía – HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023



X states observed in the $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+\pi^-\eta'$ decay



- > Structure just at or below $p\overline{p}$ threshold: X(1835)
 - Non-trivial lineshape: try to fit with Flatté or sum of interfering BWs

X states observed in the $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+\pi^-\eta'$ decay



X(2600): A New State Observed in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+\pi^-\eta^2$

10 Billion of J/ ψ data @ BESIII ($\eta' \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- / \eta \pi^+ \pi^-$)

PRL 129, 042001 (2022)



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

X(2600): A New State Observed in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+\pi^-\eta'$

PRL 129, 042001 (2022)

> Simultaneous fit to $\eta' \pi^+ \pi^-$ and $\pi^+ \pi^-$ mass spectra is performed

			η $\rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^-$	$η' \rightarrow η π^+ π^-$
Resonance	Mass (MeV/ c^2)	Width (MeV)	() 2500 (a) th	a^{1600} (b) μ^{\pm}
$f_0(1500)$	$1492.5\pm3.6^{+2.4}_{-20.5}$	$107\pm9^{+21}_{-7}$		
X(1540) X(2600)	$1540.2 \pm 7.0^{+36.3}_{-6.1}$	$157 \pm 19^{+11}_{-77}$		
 X(260) X(260) for the statist than 2 	2018.3 \pm 2.0 _{-1.4} D0) resonance ob e first time with a tical significance 20 σ	served a greater	$ \begin{array}{c} 1500 \\ 1500 \\ 2.3 \\ 2.4 \\ 2.5 \\ 2.6 \\ 2.7 \\ 2.8 \\ M_{\eta \pi^{+} \pi} (\text{GeV}/c^2) \end{array} $	$\begin{array}{c} 1000 \\ 800 \\ 600 \\ 400 \\ 200 \\ 0 \\ 2.3 \\ 2.4 \\ 2.5 \\ 2.6 \\ 2.7 \\ 2.8 \\ M_{\eta'\pi^{+}\pi} (\text{GeV}/c^2) \end{array}$
The staroun describetwe X(154)	tructure in M($\pi^+\pi$ d 1.5 GeV/ c^2 can ibed with the interven f ₀ (1500) and π 40) resonances	τ ⁻) n be well erference the	4000 (C) 3500 2500 (C) 4000 (C) 4000 2500 (C) 4000 2500 (C) 4000 2500 1500 1500 1200 1200 1.2 1.3 1.4 1.5 1.6 1.7 1.8 1.9	$\begin{array}{c} 1800 \\ 1600 \\ 1400 \\ 1200 \\ 1000 \\ 800 \\ 400 \\ 200 \\ 0 \\ 1.2 \\ 1.3 \\ 1.4 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.6 \\ 1.7 \\ 1.8 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.6 \\ 1.7 \\ 1.8 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.6 \\ 1.7 \\ 1.8 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.6 \\ 1.7 \\ 1.8 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.6 \\ 1.7 \\ 1.8 \\ 1.5 \\ 1.$
			<i>Μ</i> _{π*π} -(GeV/ <i>c</i> ²)	<i>Μ</i> _{π'π} (GeV/ <i>c</i> ²)

Observation of X(1835), X(2120), X(2370) in J/ψ EM Dalitz Decays

10 Billion of J/ ψ data @ BESIII

PRL 129, 022002



 $J/\psi \rightarrow e^+e^-\eta'\pi^+\pi^-$ Confirmation of X(1835), X(2120) and X(2370) observed in J/ ψ radiative decays

Access to the EM transition form factor between J/ ψ and X(1835) states

• Additional information on the internal structure of X(1835)

$$F(q^2) = \frac{1}{1 - q^2/\Lambda^2}$$

$$\Lambda = 1.75 \pm 0.29 \pm 0.05 \ GeV/c^2$$



$e^+e^- \rightarrow pK^-\overline{\Lambda}$: narrow structure in $p\overline{\Lambda}$ system



- Evidence of a structure in the $p\overline{\Lambda}$ system reported in several decays of B mesons and charmonium states
- Different scenarios investigated: baryonium state [PRD74,014029], barion-antibaryon SU(3) nonets [PLB626,95], final state interaction [IJMPA22,5401], ...
- ^(a) BESIII: observation of a narrow structure near the pA mass threshold, named

 X(2085), in the e⁺e⁻→pK⁻A at 6 different center of mass energies between 4.008 GeV to

 ArXiv:2303.01989

$e^+e^- \rightarrow pK^-\overline{\Lambda}$: PWA results

ArXiv:2303.01989



- ➢ Significant near threshold enhancement in the pA
 ➢ X(2085):
 - > observed with statistical significance > 20σ
 - > $J^P = 1^+$ with statistical significance > 5 σ over other quantum number

 $M_{pole} = (2086 \pm 4 \pm 6) \,\mathrm{MeV}$ $\Gamma_{pole} = (56 \pm 5 \pm 16) \,\mathrm{MeV}$

➢ No matching with any state predicted by the potential model + narrow width → exotic properties of X(2085)
 ➢ Same structure as in <u>PRL93, 112002</u> ?



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

Light hadrons in open-charm decays



Isabella Garzía - HADRON 2023 Genova - 6 June, 2023

Light hadrons in open-charm decays



Amplitude	Phase (rad)	FF (%)	BF (10 ⁻³)	σ
$D_s^+ ightarrow ar{K}^*(892)^0 K^+$	0.0 (fixed)	$32.7 \pm 2.2 \pm 1.9$	$4.77 \pm 0.38 \pm 0.32$	> 10
$D_s^+ \to K^*(892)^+ K_s^0$	$-0.16 \pm 0.12 \pm 0.11$	$13.9\pm1.7\pm1.3$	$2.03 \pm 0.26 \pm 0.20$	> 10
$D_s^+ \to a_0(980)^+ \pi^0$	$-0.97 \pm 0.27 \pm 0.25$	$7.7\pm1.7\pm1.8$	$1.12 \pm 0.25 \pm 0.27$	6.7
$D_s^+ \to \bar{K}^* (1410)^0 K^+$	$0.17 \pm 0.15 \pm 0.08$	$6.0\pm1.4\pm1.3$	$0.88 \pm 0.21 \pm 0.19$	7.6
$D_s^+ \to a_0(1817)^+ \pi^0$	$-2.55 \pm 0.21 \pm 0.07$	$23.6\pm3.4\pm2.0$	$3.44 \pm 0.52 \pm 0.32$	> 10

Conclusions

BESIII experiment is an excellent laboratory to study light hadron physics and search for light QCD exotic states

- ▶ BESIII is taking data since 2008. It will continue to run ~2030
- Selection of latest physics results on light exotic states are presented
 - > J/ψ radiative PWA
 - > $\eta_1(1855)$: first observation of exotic isoscalar 1⁻⁺ resonance in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta$ ' [PRL 129, 192002 (2022)]
 - ▶ new results on $f_0(1500)$; f0(1710) has a large overlap with the ground state scalar glueball
 - → J/ψ→γη'η': $f_0(2020)$, $f_0(2330)$ and $f_2(2340)$ observed in η'η' decay mode for the first time [<u>PRD 105, 072002(2022)</u>]
 - ▶ $f_2(2340)$ as tensor glueball candidate
 - \succ η(1405)/η(1475) puzzle: J/ψ→γK⁰_SK⁰_Sπ⁰ [JHEP03(2023)121]
 - sizable ss component
 - two separate states

Conclusions

BESIII experiment is an excellent laboratory to study light hadron physics and search for light QCD exotic states

- ▶ BESIII is taking data since 2008. It will continue to run ~2030
- Selection of latest physics results on light exotic states are presented
 - → X(1835), X(2120), X(2370), X(2600) observed in J/ ψ →γη' $\pi^+\pi^-$
 - ➤ X(2600) observed for the first time [<u>PRL 129, 042001 (2022)</u>]
 - ► X(1835), X(2120), X(2370) observed in J/ ψ EM Dalitz Decay [<u>PRL 129</u>, <u>022002</u>]

 - Light hadron $a_0(1817)$ observed in open-charm decays [PRL129, 182001 (2022)]

More interesting results are expected





Back-up slídes

The BESIII Detector

Nucl. Instr. Meth. A614, 345 (2010)



 $\sigma_{xy} \sim (6 \text{ mm})/E^{1/2} @ 1 \text{ GeV}$

Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

 $\sigma_{pt}/p_t \sim 0.5 \%$ @ 1 GeV

BESIII physics programme

Light hadron physics

- Meson and baryon spectroscopy
- Multiquark states
- Threshold effects
- Glueballs and hybrids
- two-photon physics
- Form factors

QCD and τ

- Precision R measurement
- τ decay

Charmonium physics

- Precision spectroscopy
- Transitions and decays

XYZ meson physics

- Y(4260), Y(4360) properties
- Z_c(3900)⁺, ...

Charm physics

- Semi-leptonic form factors
- Decay constants f_{D} and f_{Ds}
- CKM matrix: $|V_{cd}|$ and $|V_{cs}|$
- $D^0 \overline{D}^0$ mixing, CPV
- Strong phases

Precision mass measurements

- τ mass
- D, D^{*} mass

Isabella Garzía - Uníversity of Ferrara and INFN

Further Checks on the $\eta_1(1855)$

The $\cos(\theta_{\eta})$ distribution can be expressed as an expansion in terms of Legendre polynomials; the coefficients (unnormalized moments of expansion) characterize the spin of the $\eta\eta$ ' resonances $\langle Y_l^0 \rangle \equiv \sum_{i=1}^{N_k} W_i Y_l^0 (\cos\theta_{\eta}^i)$

Neglecting resonance contributions in the γη^(`) subsystem and amplitude with spin greater than 2, the moments are related to the spin-0 (S), spin-1 (P) and spin-2 (D) amplitudes



 Good data/PWA consistency

Narrow structure in
 <Y⁰₁>: η₁(1855) P-wave component is needed

*Assuming $\eta\eta$ 'system has zero helicity

Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

Discussion about $f_0(1500)$ and $f_0(1710)$

The dominant contributions in the baseline PWA are from scalar resonance: $\frac{1}{PR}$

PRD 106,072012 (2022)

Decay mode	Resonance	$M ({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	Γ (MeV)	$M_{\rm PDG}~({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	$\Gamma_{\rm PDG}$ (MeV)	B.F. (×10 ⁻⁵)	Sig.
	$f_0(1500)$	1506	112	1506	112	$1.81{\pm}0.11^{+0.19}_{-0.13}$	$\gg 30\sigma$
	$f_0(1810)$	1795	95	1795	95	$0.11{\pm}0.01^{+0.04}_{-0.03}$	11.1σ
	$f_0(2020)$	$2010{\pm}6^{+6}_{-4}$	$203{\pm}9^{+13}_{-11}$	1992	442	$2.28{\pm}0.12^{+0.29}_{-0.20}$	24.6σ
$J/\psi \to \gamma X \to \gamma \eta \eta'$	$f_0(2330)$	$2312{\pm}7^{+7}_{-3}$	$65{\pm}10^{+3}_{-12}$	2314	144	$0.10{\pm}0.02^{+0.01}_{-0.02}$	13.2σ
	$\eta_1(1855)$	$1855{\pm}9^{+6}_{-1}$	$188{\pm}18^{+3}_{-8}$	-	-	$0.27{\pm}0.04^{+0.02}_{-0.04}$	21.4σ
	$f_2(1565)$	1542	122	1542	122	$0.32{\pm}0.05^{+0.12}_{-0.02}$	8.7σ
	$f_2(2010)$	$2062{\pm}6^{+10}_{-7}$	$165{\pm}17^{+10}_{-5}$	2011	202	$0.71{\pm}0.06^{+0.10}_{-0.06}$	13.4 <i>σ</i>
	$f_4(2050)$	2018	237	2018	237	$0.06{\pm}0.01^{+0.03}_{-0.01}$	4.6σ
	0 ⁺⁺ PHSP	-	-	-	-	$1.44{\pm}0.15^{+0.10}_{-0.20}$	15.7σ
$\overline{J/\psi \to \eta' X \to \gamma \eta \eta'}$	$h_1(1415)$	1416	90	1416	90	$0.08{\pm}0.01^{+0.01}_{-0.02}$	10.2σ
	$h_1(1595)$	1584	384	1584	384	$0.16{\pm}0.02^{+0.03}_{-0.01}$	9.9σ

$$\frac{\mathcal{B}(f_0(1500) \to \eta \eta')}{\mathcal{B}(f_0(1500) \to \pi \pi)} = \frac{(8.96^{+2.95}_{-2.87} \times 10^{-2})}{(1.66^{+0.42}_{-0.40} \times 10^{-1})^*}$$

$$\frac{\mathcal{B}(f_0(1710) \to \eta \eta')}{\mathcal{B}(f_0(1710) \to \pi \pi)} < \frac{1.61 \times 10^{-3}}{2.87 \times 10^{-3}} *$$

@90% C.L.

Consistent with PDG

This suppressed decay rate supports the hypothesis that the $f_0(1710)$ has a large overlap with the ground state scalar glueball (<u>PRD 92,121902</u>)

*Erratum ready soon

Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

Dalítz Plot $-J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^{0}{}_{S}K^{0}{}_{S}\pi^{0}$

JHEP03(2023)121



Dalitz Plot $- J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^{0}{}_{S}K^{0}{}_{S}\pi^{0}$



Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

$M({ m MeV}/c^2)$	$\Gamma({ m MeV})$	Decay Mode	B.F.	$\operatorname{Sig.}(\sigma)$
(1405) 1201 7 + 0.7+11.3	$60.8 \pm 1.9 \pm 5.5$	$J/\psi \to \gamma \eta (1405) \to \gamma K^0_S (K^0_S \pi^0)_{\rm P-wave} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$	$(5.84 \pm 0.12^{+2.03}_{-3.36}) \times 10^{-5}$	$\gg 35$
$1391.7 \pm 0.7_{-0.3}$	$00.0 \pm 1.2_{-12.0}$	$J/\psi \to \gamma \eta (1405) \to \gamma (K_S^0 K_S^0)_{\text{S-wave}} \pi^0 \to \gamma K_S^0 K_S^0 \pi^0$	$(2.88 \pm 0.04^{+1.64}_{-0.38}) \times 10^{-5}$	18.4
-(1475) 1507 $c + 1 c + 15.5$ 115 c	$115.8 \pm 2.4^{+14.8}$	$J/\psi \to \gamma \eta(1475) \to \gamma K^0_S (K^0_S \pi^0)_{\text{P-wave}} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$	$(6.58 \pm 0.12^{+3.98}_{-2.82}) \times 10^{-5}$	$\gg 35$
$1507.0 \pm 1.0_{-32.2}$	$115.8 \pm 2.4_{-10.9}$	$J/\psi \to \gamma \eta (1475) \to \gamma (K_S^0 K_S^0)_{\text{S-wave}} \pi^0 \to \gamma K_S^0 K_S^0 \pi^0$	$(3.99\pm0.09^{+0.41}_{-0.66})\times10^{-5}$	$\gg 35$
$1280.2\pm0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5}$	$28.2 \pm 1.1^{+5.5}_{-2.9}$	$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_1(1285) \rightarrow \gamma a_0(980)^0 \pi^0 \rightarrow \gamma K_S^0 K_S^0 \pi^0$	$(8.55 \pm 0.41^{+3.42}_{-1.04}) \times 10^{-6}$	$\gg 35$
$14335 \pm 11^{+27.9}$	$05.0 \pm 2.2^{+13.6}$	$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_1(1420) \rightarrow \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \rightarrow \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$	$(7.25 \pm 0.12^{+0.73}_{-1.25}) \times 10^{-5}$	$\gg 35$
$1455.0 \pm 1.1_{-0.7}$	$1_{-0.7}$ $30.9 \pm 2.0_{-10.9}$	$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_1(1420) \rightarrow \gamma a_0(980)^0 \pi^0 \rightarrow \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$	$(4.62\pm0.36^{+2.36}_{-1.94}) imes10^{-6}$	17.8
$1515.4 \pm 2.5 \substack{+3.2 \\ -7.6}$	$64.0\pm4.3^{+2.0}_{-6.1}$	$J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma f_2(1525) \rightarrow \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \rightarrow \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0$	$(9.47\pm0.43^{+1.51}_{-0.66}) imes10^{-6}$	23.8
	$\begin{split} M(\text{MeV}/c^2) \\ 1391.7 \pm 0.7^{+11.3}_{-0.3} \\ 1507.6 \pm 1.6^{+15.5}_{-32.2} \\ 1280.2 \pm 0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5} \\ 1433.5 \pm 1.1^{+27.9}_{-0.7} \\ 1515.4 \pm 2.5^{+3.2}_{-7.6} \end{split}$	$M(\text{MeV}/c^2)$ $\Gamma(\text{MeV})$ $1391.7 \pm 0.7^{+11.3}_{-0.3}$ $60.8 \pm 1.2^{+5.5}_{-12.0}$ $1507.6 \pm 1.6^{+15.5}_{-32.2}$ $115.8 \pm 2.4^{+14.8}_{-10.9}$ $1280.2 \pm 0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5}$ $28.2 \pm 1.1^{+5.5}_{-2.9}$ $1433.5 \pm 1.1^{+27.9}_{-0.7}$ $95.9 \pm 2.3^{+13.6}_{-10.9}$ $1515.4 \pm 2.5^{+3.2}_{-7.6}$ $64.0 \pm 4.3^{+2.0}_{-6.1}$	$ \begin{array}{c} M({\rm MeV}/c^2) & \Gamma({\rm MeV}) & {\rm Decay\ Mode} \\ \\ 1391.7 \pm 0.7^{+11.3}_{-0.3} & {}_{60.8 \pm 1.2^{+5.5}_{-12.0}} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1405) \to \gamma K^0_S (K^0_S \pi^0)_{\rm P-wave} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1405) \to \gamma (K^0_S K^0_S)_{\rm S-wave} \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} \\ \\ 1507.6 \pm 1.6^{+15.5}_{-32.2} & 115.8 \pm 2.4^{+14.8}_{-10.9} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1475) \to \gamma K^0_S (K^0_S \pi^0)_{\rm P-wave} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1475) \to \gamma (K^0_S K^0_S)_{\rm S-wave} \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} \\ \\ 1280.2 \pm 0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5} & 28.2 \pm 1.1^{+5.5}_{-2.9} & J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1285) \to \gamma a_0(980)^0 \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0 \\ \\ 1433.5 \pm 1.1^{+27.9}_{-0.7} & 9_{5.9 \pm 2.3^{+13.6}_{-10.9}} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1420) \to \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1420) \to \gamma a_0(980)^0 \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} \\ \\ 1515.4 \pm 2.5^{+3.2}_{-7.6} & 64.0 \pm 4.3^{+2.0}_{-6.1} & J/\psi \to \gamma f_2(1525) \to \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0 \end{array} $	$ \begin{array}{ccc} M({\rm MeV}/c^2) & \Gamma({\rm MeV}) & {\rm Decay\ Mode} & {\rm B.F.} \\ \\ 1391.7 \pm 0.7^{+11.3}_{-0.3} & {}_{0.8} \pm 1.2^{+5.5}_{-12.0} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1405) \to \gamma K^0_S(K^0_S\pi^0)_{\rm P-wave} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S\pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1405) \to \gamma (K^0_S K^0_S)_{\rm S-wave} \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} & (2.88 \pm 0.04^{+1.64}_{-0.38}) \times 10^{-5} \\ \\ 1507.6 \pm 1.6^{+15.5}_{-32.2} & {}_{115.8} \pm 2.4^{+14.8}_{-10.0} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1475) \to \gamma K^0_S (K^0_S \pi^0)_{\rm P-wave} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma\eta(1475) \to \gamma (K^0_S K^0_S)_{\rm S-wave} \pi^0 \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} & (3.99 \pm 0.09^{+0.66}_{-0.48}) \times 10^{-5} \\ \\ 1280.2 \pm 0.6^{+1.2}_{-1.5} & 28.2 \pm 1.1^{+5.5}_{-2.9} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1285) \to \gamma a_0(980)^{-0.7}_{-0.7} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1420) \to \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} & (3.55 \pm 0.41^{+3.42}_{-1.25}) \times 10^{-5} \\ \\ 1433.5 \pm 1.1^{+27.9}_{-0.7} & 95.9 \pm 2.3^{+13.6}_{-10.9} & \frac{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1420) \to \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0}{J/\psi \to \gamma f_1(1420) \to \gamma a_0(980)^{-0.7}_{-0.7} \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0} & (4.62 \pm 0.36^{+2.36}_{-1.94}) \times 10^{-6} \\ \\ 1515.4 \pm 2.5^{+3.2}_{-7.6} & 64.0 \pm 4.3^{+2.0}_{-6.1} & J/\psi \to \gamma f_2(1525) \to \gamma K^*(892)^0 K^0_S \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \pi^0 & (9.47 \pm 0.43^{+1.51}_{-0.66}) \times 10^{-6} \\ \end{array}$

X(18xx) between 1.8-1.9 GeV



Other Results on X(1835)

2

 $M(\gamma\phi)$ (GeV/c²)



J/ $\psi \rightarrow \gamma$ η' $\pi^- \pi^+$ Significant distortion of the $\eta' \pi^- \pi^+$ line shape

near the ppbar mass threshold

Two fit models are taken into account and both support the existence of a $p\overline{p}$ moleculelike or bound state

1.3×10⁹ J/ψ @ BESIII

1.09×10⁹ J/ψ @ BESIII

 $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \gamma \phi$: two structures corresponding to

- $\eta(1475)$ and X(1835) are observed
- X(1835) and $\eta(1475)$: $J^{PC} = 0^{-+}$ assignment favored
- Sizable $s\bar{s}$ component in X(1835)
 - more complicated than a pure $N\overline{N}$ state

Solution	Resonance	$m_R ({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	Γ (MeV)
I (Destr. Int.) II (Constr. Int.)	$\eta(1475) \ X(1835) \ \eta(1475) \ X(1835) \ X(1835)$	$\begin{array}{c} 1477 \pm 7 \pm 13 \\ 1839 \pm 26 \pm 26 \\ 1477 \pm 7 \pm 13 \\ 1839 \pm 26 \pm 26 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 118 \pm 22 \pm 17 \\ 175 \pm 57 \pm 25 \\ 118 \pm 22 \pm 17 \\ 175 \pm 57 \pm 25 \end{array}$

Isabella Garzía - Uníversity of Ferrara and INFN

 $M(\gamma \phi)$ (GeV/c²)

Search for X(1835) in other decay modes

• $J/\psi \rightarrow \omega \eta' \pi^+ \pi^-$ hadronic decay and search for X(1835) $\rightarrow \eta' \pi^+ \pi^-$

PRD 99, 071101 (R) (2019)



- No obvious sign of X(1835)'s existence
- Large gluon component? [PRD74,034019]

 $\mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \omega \eta' \pi^+ \pi^-) = (1.12 \pm 0.02 \pm 0.13) \times 10^{-3}$ $\mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \omega X(1835), \ X(1835) \to \eta' \pi^+ \pi^-) < 6.2 \times 10^{-5}$

@ 90% C.L.

2.1

22

2

The puzzle is still not complete

Isabella Garzía - Uníversity of Ferrara and INFN



First Observation of X(2370) in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K \overline{K} \eta'$

- X(2120) and X(2370) states observed in the $\pi^-\pi^+\eta$ ' invariant mass spectra (PRL106,072002)
- The **X(2370)** measured mass is consistent with the pseudoscalar glueball candidate predicted by LQCD calculation (PRD**73**,014516)
- Simulataneus fit performed for two decay η' modes

> No evidence of X(2120) is found

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2120) \to \gamma K^+ K^- \eta') &< 1.49 \times 10^{-5} \\ \mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2120) \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \eta') &< 6.38 \times 10^{-6} \end{split}$$



Clear X(2370) signal observed with significance of about 8.3σ

$$\begin{split} M_{X(2370)} &= 2341.6 \pm 6.5 \pm 5.7 \; \mathrm{MeV}/c^2 \quad \Gamma_{X(2370)} = 117 \pm 10 \pm 8 \; \mathrm{MeV} \\ \mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2370) \to \gamma K^+ K^- \eta') &= (1.79 \pm 0.23 \pm 0.65) \times 10^{-5} \\ \mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2370) \to \gamma K^0_S K^0_S \eta') &= (1.18 \pm 0.32 \pm 0.39) \times 10^{-5} \end{split}$$

Isabella Garzía - Uníversíty of Ferrara and INFN

Search for X(2370) in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta \eta$



Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

Branching ratios prediction for the decay of pseudoscalar glueball with M~2.37 GeV into three pseudoscalar mesons (PRD **87**,054036 (2013))

$$\Gamma_{G \to \eta \eta \eta'} / \Gamma_G^{tot} = 0.00082$$

$$\Gamma_{G \to KK\eta'} / \Gamma_G^{tot} = 0.011$$

$$\Gamma_{G \to \pi \pi \eta'} / \Gamma_G^{tot} = 0.090$$

➢ No obvious signal of X(2370)

Simultaneous unbinned maximum likelihood fit to the $\eta\eta\eta$ ' is performed and the 90% C.L. upper limit is calculated

(it does not contradict PRD 87,054036)

FIRST OBSERVATION in the ηηη' invariant mass spectra

First Observation of X(2370) in $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K \overline{K} \eta'$



Amplitude Analyses in BESIII

- J/ ψ radiative decays are ideal for searching glueballs
 - $J/\psi \to \gamma PP: 0^{++}, 2^{++}, ...$
 - $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma PPP, \gamma VV: 0^{-+}$
- Neutral channel is much cleaner than the charged ones
- Very complicated mass spectrum in the low mass region: many broad, overlapping states complicate the study of the spectra
- Amplitude analysis: toll to extract the complex amplitudes from experimental data
 - Models with free parameters
 - Consider the kinematic of final states particles
 - Vary the parameters to maximize the likelihood
 - Mass Dependent (MD) PWA: model the dynamics of particle interactions as coherent sum of resonances
 - Mass Independent (MI) PWA: make minimal model assumptions and measure the dynamical amplitudes independently in small regions of two-meson invariant mass (PRD92, 052003 (2015))



Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

PWA of J/ψ \rightarrow γηη

PRD 87, 092009 (2013)

- $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta$: clean laboratory to search for 0++ and 2++ states
- PWA based on $2.25 \times 10^8 \text{ J/}\psi$ events



Isabella Garzía – University of Ferrara and INFN

PWA of J/ψ \rightarrow γηη

- $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta$: clean laboratory to search for 0++ and 2++ states
- PWA based on $2.25 \times 10^8 \text{ J/}\psi$ events

Resonance	Mass (MeV/ c^2)	Width (MeV/ c^2)	$\mathcal{B}(J/\psi \to \gamma X \to \gamma \eta \eta)$	Significance
f ₀ (1500)	1468^{+14+23}_{-15-74}	$136^{+41+28}_{-26-100}$	$(1.65^{+0.26+0.51}_{-0.31-1.40}) imes 10^{-5}$	8.2σ
f ₀ (1710)	$1759 \pm 6^{+14}_{-25}$	$172 \pm 10^{+32}_{-16}$	$(2.35^{+0.13+1.24}_{-0.11-0.74}) imes 10^{-4}$	25.0σ
$f_0(2100)$	$2081 \pm 13^{+24}_{-36}$	273^{+27+70}_{-24-23}	$(1.13^{+0.09+0.64}_{-0.10-0.28}) imes 10^{-4}$	13.9σ
^r ₂ (1525)	$1513 \pm 5^{+4}_{-10}$	75^{+12+16}_{-10-8}	$(3.42^{+0.43+1.37}_{-0.51-1.30}) \times 10^{-5}$	11.0σ
f ₂ (1810)	1822^{+29+66}_{-24-57}	$229^{+52+88}_{-42-155}$	$(5.40^{+0.60+3.42}_{-0.67-2.35}) \times 10^{-5}$	6.4σ
f ₂ (2340)	$2362^{+31+140}_{-30-63}$	$334^{+62+165}_{-54-100}$	$(5.60^{+0.62+2.37}_{-0.65-2.07}) imes 10^{-5}$	7.6 <i>o</i>



- $f_0(1500)$ dominant decays are 4π and $\pi\pi$
- The production rate of $f_0(1710)$ is compatible with LQCD (PRL110,021601) prediction for a pure scalar glueball
 - Suggest a large overlap with 0++ gluball
- PWA requires a strong contribution from f₂(2340) with fairly large production rate ⇒ it *could be a good candidate for the lowest lying tensor glueball*

PRD 87, 092009 (2013)

• J/ $\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta$: clean laboratory to search for 0++ and 2++ states

• PWA based on $2.25 \times 10^8 \text{ J/}\psi$ events





• $f_0(1500)$ dominant decays are 4π and $\pi\pi$

 \mathcal{PWA} of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \eta \eta$

- The production rate of $f_0(1710)$ is compatible with LQCD (PRL110,021601) prediction for a pure scalar glueball
 - Suggest a large overlap with 0++ glueball
- PWA requires a strong contribution from f₂(2340) with fairly large production rate ⇒ it could be a good candidate for the lowest lying tensor glueball

PRD 87, 092009 (2013)

 $\mathcal{PWA} \text{ of } J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K^{O}{}_{S}K^{O}{}_{S}$

- $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma K_S K_S$: clean laboratory to search for even++ states
- PWA based on 1311M of J/ψ events



Resonance	$M ({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	$M_{\rm PDG}~({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	$\Gamma (\text{MeV}/c^2)$	$\Gamma_{\rm PDG}~({\rm MeV}/c^2)$	Branching fraction	Significance
K*(892)	896	895.81 ± 0.19	48	47.4 ± 0.6	$(6.28^{+0.16+0.59}_{-0.17-0.52}) \times 10^{-6}$	35σ
$K_1(1270)$	1272	1272 ± 7	90	90 ± 20	$(8.54^{+1.07+2.35}_{-1.20-2.13}) \times 10^{-7}$	16σ
$f_0(1370)$	$1350\pm9^{+12}_{-2}$	1200 to 1500	$231 \pm 21^{+28}_{-48}$	200 to 500	$(1.07^{+0.08+0.36}_{-0.07-0.34}) \times 10^{-5}$	25σ
$f_0(1500)$	1505	1504 ± 6	109	109 ± 7	$(1.59^{+0.16+0.18}_{-0.16-0.56}) \times 10^{-5}$	23σ
$f_0(1710)$	$1765\pm2^{+1}_{-1}$	1723^{+6}_{-5}	$146\pm 3^{+7}_{-1}$	139 ± 8	$(2.00^{+0.03+0.31}_{-0.02-0.10}) \times 10^{-4}$	$\gg 35\sigma$
$f_0(1790)$	$1870\pm7^{+2}_{-3}$		$146 \pm 14^{+7}_{-15}$		$(1.11^{+0.06+0.19}_{-0.06-0.32}) \times 10^{-5}$	24σ
$f_0(2200)$	$2184 \pm 5^{+4}_{-2}$	2189 ± 13	$364\pm9^{+4}_{-7}$	238 ± 50	$(2.72^{+0.08+0.17}_{-0.06-0.47}) \times 10^{-4}$	$\gg 35\sigma$
$f_0(2330)$	$2411\pm10\pm7$		$349 \pm 18^{+23}_{-1}$		$(4.95^{+0.21+0.66}_{-0.21-0.72}) \times 10^{-5}$	35σ
$f_2(1270)$	1275	1275.5 ± 0.8	185	$186.7^{+2.2}_{-2.5}$	$(2.58^{+0.08+0.59}_{-0.09-0.20}) \times 10^{-5}$	33σ
$f'_2(1525)$	1516 ± 1	1525 ± 5	$75\pm1\pm1$	73_5	$(7.99^{+0.03+0.69}_{-0.04-0.50}) \times 10^{-5}$	$\gg 35\sigma$
$f_2(2340)$	$2233 \pm 34^{+9}_{-25}$	2345_{-40}^{+50}	$507\pm37^{+18}_{-21}$	322_{-60}^{+70}	$(5.54^{+0.34+3.82}_{-0.40-1.49}) \times 10^{-5}$	26σ
0 ⁺⁺ PHSP					$(1.85^{+0.05+0.68}_{-0.05-0.26}) \times 10^{-5}$	26σ
2 ⁺⁺ PHSP					$(5.73^{+0.99+4.18}_{-1.00-3.74}) \times 10^{-5}$	13σ

Isabella Garzía - University of Ferrara and INFN

PRD **98**, 072003 (2018)

Global Fit

• $f_0(1710)$ and $f_0(2200)$ dominate the scalar spectrum, but we need also to include $f_0(2330)$

5000

4000

2000 Events

Pull

1000

- **BR** of $f_0(1710)$ is one order of magnitude larger than BR of $f_0(1500)$: $f_0(1710)$ overlap with glueball state
- Structure near 1.5 GeV dominated by tensor contribution f₂'(1525), while above 2 GeV is dominantly f₂(2340)



FIG. 1. Two Regge trajectories for the isovector and isoscalar scalar states. Here, the red triangles denote the $a_0(1817)$ and X(1812), while the solid points and empty circles are the experimental and predicted states, respectively. Except the $a_0(1817)$, X(1812) and predicted $a_0(2115)$, $f_0(1450)$, the masses of the other scalar states are taken from PDG. Here, the established states are marked by the black solid points, while the predicted states are denoted by the black circles. The error bars present total experimental uncertainties.