

Challenges and prospects for baryonic resonances from lattice QCD

Maxwell T. Hansen

October 19th, 2022



THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH

- 1. Lagrangian defining QCD
- 2. Formal / numerical machinery (lattice QCD)
- 3. A few experimental inputs (e.g. $M_{\pi}, M_{K}, M_{\Omega}$)



- 1. Lagrangian defining QCD
- 2. Formal / numerical machinery (lattice QCD)
- 3. A few experimental inputs (e.g. $M_{\pi}, M_{K}, M_{\Omega}$)



Wide range of precision pre-/post-dictions



- 1. Lagrangian defining QCD
- 2. Formal / numerical machinery (lattice QCD)
- **3.** A few experimental inputs (e.g. $M_{\pi}, M_{K}, M_{\Omega}$)



Wide range of precision pre-/post-dictions



- 1. Lagrangian defining QCD
- 2. Formal / numerical machinery (lattice QCD)
- **3.** A few experimental inputs (e.g. $M_{\pi}, M_{K}, M_{\Omega}$)

Overwhelming evidence for QCD \checkmark



Lattice QCD as a reliable tool \checkmark

Wide range of precision pre-/post-dictions



More challenging observables?

Baryonic resonances



heavier than physical M_{π}

Height of rectangle = statistical uncertainty

States created using local operators

• Dudek and Edwards, *Hybrid Baryons in QCD*, PRD, 2012 •

Baryonic resonances



Remarkable progress... but not the complete picture!

• Dudek and Edwards, *Hybrid Baryons in QCD*, PRD, 2012 •

QCD Fock space

 \Box At low-energies QCD = hadronic degrees of freedom $\pi \sim \bar{u}d, \ K \sim \bar{s}u, \ p \sim uud$

 \Box Overlaps of multi-hadron *asymptotic states* \rightarrow S matrix

QCD Fock space

☐ At low-energies QCD = hadronic degrees of freedom $\pi \sim \overline{u}d$, $K \sim \overline{s}u$, $p \sim uud$ ☐ Overlaps of multi-hadron *asymptotic states* → S matrix



QCD Fock space

☐ At low-energies QCD = hadronic degrees of freedom $\pi \sim \overline{u}d$, $K \sim \overline{s}u$, $p \sim uud$ ☐ Overlaps of multi-hadron *asymptotic states* → S matrix



Poles on the second Riemann sheet give resonances

Full QCD demands this description... lattice QCD cannot escape it

Unitarity and analyticity

 \Box For $s < (M_N + 2M_\pi)^2$, the optical theorem tells us... $\rho_{N\pi}(s) |\mathcal{M}_{J,\ell}(s)|^2 = \operatorname{Im} \mathcal{M}_{J,\ell}(s)$

where $\rho_{N\pi}(s) = \sqrt{p^2(s, M_{\pi}, M_N)/s}$ is the phase space... continuum of $N\pi$ states



Unitarity and analyticity

 \Box For $s < (M_N + 2M_\pi)^2$, the optical theorem tells us... $\rho_{N\pi}(s) |\mathcal{M}_{J,\ell}(s)|^2 = \operatorname{Im} \mathcal{M}_{J,\ell}(s)$

where $\rho_{N\pi}(s) = \sqrt{p^2(s, M_{\pi}, M_N)/s}$ is the phase space... continuum of $N\pi$ states



Amplitude has a branch cut \checkmark

K-matrix is useful for parametrizing \checkmark

Lattice QCD

observable? =
$$\int d^N \! \phi \, e^{-S} \begin{bmatrix} \text{interpolator} \\ \text{for observable} \end{bmatrix}$$

To proceed we have to make *three modifications*





Also... $M_{\pi, \text{lattice}} > M_{\pi, \text{our universe}}$

(but physical masses \rightarrow increasingly common)



Difficulties for multi-hadron observables

- The Euclidean signature...
 - **O** Prevents usual on-shell approach (want $p_4^2 = -E(p)^2$, but have only $p_4^2 > 0$)



- **The finite volume...**
 - **O** Discretizes the spectrum
 - Eliminates the branch cuts and extra sheets
 - Hides the resonance poles

Difficulties for multi-hadron observables

- The Euclidean signature...
 - **O** Prevents usual on-shell approach (want $p_4^2 = -E(p)^2$, but have only $p_4^2 > 0$)



- The finite volume...
 - **O** Discretizes the spectrum
 - O Eliminates the branch cuts and extra sheets
 - Hides the resonance poles



The finite-volume as a tool Finite-volume set-up



cubic, spatial volume (extent L)
periodic
L is large enough to neglect $e^{-M_{\pi}L}$

The finite-volume as a tool

☐ Finite-volume set-up



cubic, spatial volume (extent L)
periodic
L is large enough to neglect $e^{-M_{\pi}L}$

G Scattering leaves an *imprint* on finite-volume quantities





- The finite-volume as a tool
 - Finite-volume set-up



cubic, spatial volume (extent L)
periodic
L is large enough to neglect $e^{-M_{\pi}L}$

Scattering leaves an *imprint* on finite-volume quantities



General method

$$\det[\mathcal{K}^{-1}(s) + F(P,L)] = 0 \qquad F(P,L) \equiv \underset{\text{geometric functions}}{\operatorname{Matrix of known}}$$

Holds only for two-particle energies $s < (M_N + 2M_\pi)^2$ Neglects $e^{-M_\pi L}$ Generalized to non-degenerate masses, multiple channels, spinning particles Encodes angular momentum mixing

□ Single-channel case (pions in a p-wave)

$$\mathcal{K}(s_n)^{-1} = \rho \cot \delta(s_n) = -F(E_n, \vec{P}, L)$$



□ Single-channel case (pions in a p-wave)

$$\mathcal{K}(s_n)^{-1} = \rho \cot \delta(s_n) = -F(E_n, \vec{P}, L)$$



□ Single-channel case (pions in a p-wave)

$$\mathcal{K}(s_n)^{-1} = \rho \cot \delta(s_n) = -F(E_n, \vec{P}, L)$$



□ Single-channel case (pions in a p-wave)

$$\mathcal{K}(s_n)^{-1} = \rho \cot \delta(s_n) = -F(E_n, \vec{P}, L)$$



Single-channel case (pions in a p-wave)

$$\mathcal{K}(s_n)^{-1} = \rho \cot \delta(s_n) = -F(E_n, \vec{P}, L)$$



Two types of spectroscopy

Explore the spectrum of compact QCD excited states

(via quark-model inspired local operators)



Dudek, Edwards (2012)

Two types of spectroscopy

Explore the spectrum of compact QCD excited states

(via quark-model inspired local operators)



Extract the full finite-volume energy spectrum





Dudek, Edwards (2012)

Wilson, Briceño, Dudek, Edwards, Thomas (2015)







$$\begin{array}{c} \rho \rightarrow \pi\pi \\ \hline \rho \rightarrow \pi\pi \\ \hline CP-PACS/PACS-CS 2007, 2011 \\ \hline ETMC 2010 \\ \hline Lang et al. 2011 \\ \hline HadSpec 2012, 2016 \\ \hline Pellisier 2012 \\ \hline Guo et al. 2016 \\ \hline HadSpec 2012, 2016 \\ \hline Pellisier 2012 \\ \hline Guo et al. 2016 \\ \hline HadSpec 2012, 2016 \\ \hline HadSpec 2012 \\ \hline Guo et al. 2017 \\ \hline HadSpec 2012 \\ \hline HadSpec 2$$

 $\Delta \to N\pi$

Andersen et al. 2018
Andersen et al. 2019
Silvi et al. 2021
Pittler et al. 2021
Bulava et al. 2022

 $N^* \to N\pi$

Lang et al. 2017
 Wu et al. 2017
 Kiratidis et al. 2017

 $\Lambda \to \overline{K}N$

□ Hall et al. 2015



(focusing here on studies with scattering states)

Baryons are difficult!

See also...

- Detmold and Nicholson 2015
- Wu et al. 2018
- □ Xing & Liu, LATT2022 (in prep)

$\Delta \to N\pi$
<u>Andersen et al. 2018</u>
<u>Andersen et al. 2019</u>
<u>Silvi et al. 2021</u>
Pittler et al. 2021
<u>Bulava et al. 2022</u>

 $N^* \to N\pi$

Lang et al. 2017
 Wu et al. 2017
 Kiratidis et al. 2017

 $\Lambda \to \overline{K}N$

□ Hall et al. 2015



(focusing here on studies with scattering states)

Baryons are difficult!

See also...

- Detmold and Nicholson 2015
- 🗍 Wu et al. 2018
- □ Xing & Liu, LATT2022 (in prep)

$N\pi$ elastic scattering ($M_{\pi} = 255$ MeV)

PHYSICAL REVIEW D

covering particles, fields, gravitation, and cosmology

P-wave nucleon-pion scattering amplitude in the $\Delta(1232)$ channel from lattice QCD

Giorgio Silvi, Srijit Paul, Constantia Alexandrou, Stefan Krieg, Luka Leskovec, Stefan Meinel, John Negele, Marcus Petschlies, Andrew Pochinsky, Gumaro Rendon, Sergey Syritsyn, and Antonino Todaro

 $\square M_{\pi} = 255 \text{ MeV}$

 \Box Studied scattering-lengths and the Δ channel

I = 3/2: $J^P = 1/2^-(S)$, $3/2^+(P)$ $[1/2^+(P), 3/2^-(D), 5/2^-(D)]$

 \Box Local Δ -like operators + $N(p_1)\pi(p_2)$ operators

• Silvi et al., PRD 2021, 2101.00689 •

 $N\pi$ finite-volume energies ($M_{\pi} = 255$ MeV)



 $N\pi \rightarrow \Delta \rightarrow N\pi$ ($M_{\pi} = 255 \text{ MeV}$)





• Silvi et al., PRD 2021, 2101.00689 •

- $\Delta \to N\pi$
- Andersen et al. 2018
 Andersen et al. 2019
 Silvi et al. 2021
 Pittler et al. 2021
 Bulava et al. 2022

 $N^* \to N\pi$

Lang et al. 2017
 Wu et al. 2017
 Kiratidis et al. 2017

 $\Lambda \to \overline{K}N$

□ Hall et al. 2015



(focusing here on studies with scattering states)

Baryons are difficult!



See also...

- Detmold and Nicholson 2015
- Wu et al. 2018
- □ Xing & Liu, LATT2022 (in prep)

$N\pi$ elastic scattering ($M_{\pi} = 200 \text{ MeV}$)

 $\exists r i V > hep-lat > arXiv:2208.03867$

High Energy Physics - Lattice

[Submitted on 8 Aug 2022]

Elastic nucleon-pion scattering at $m_{\pi} \approx 200 \text{ MeV}$ from lattice QCD

John Bulava, Andrew D. Hanlon, Ben Hörz, Colin Morningstar, Amy Nicholson, Fernando Romero-López, Sarah Skinner, Pavlos Vranas, André Walker-Loud

□ Studied scattering-lengths and the Δ channel I = 1/2: $J^P = 1/2^-$ (S) I = 3/2: $J^P = 1/2^-$ (S), $3/2^+$ (P) $[1/2^+$ (P), $3/2^-$ (D), $5/2^-$ (D)]

Advanced operators + fits to extract finite-volume energies

• Bulava et al. (2022) 2208.03867 •

 $N\pi$ finite-volume energies ($M_{\pi} = 200 \text{ MeV}$)



 $N\pi \to \Delta \to N\pi$

Scattering phase shift Δ summary plot Physical point Ð Andersen et al. 2018 Silvi et al. 2021 Ŧ 1350-I₩ This work (MeV) 1300 m $\pi/2$ · $\delta_{3/2^+}$ 1250 * 0 •• 40 [⊭]N⊽ 630 0.0 0.51.0 1.52.02.5 $(q_{ m cm}/m_\pi)^2$ * Ŧ H 20 206 255139280 m_{π} (MeV)

• Bulava et al. (2022) 2208.03867 •

- $\Delta \to N\pi$
- Andersen et al. 2018
 Andersen et al. 2019
 Silvi et al. 2021
 Pittler et al. 2021
 Bulava et al. 2022

 $N^* \to N\pi$

Lang et al. 2017

Wu et al. 2017



(focusing here on studies with scattering states)

Baryons are difficult!

Kiratidis et al. 2017

 $\Lambda \to \overline{K}N$

□ Hall et al. 2015



See also...

- Detmold and Nicholson 2015
- Wu et al. 2018
- □ Xing & Liu, LATT2022 (in prep)

□ Results with impressive operators from Lang et al., $M_{\pi} = 156$ MeV □ Interpretation presented by D. Leinweber this morning



• Lang, Leskovec, Padmanath, Prelovsek (2017) •

□ Results with impressive operators from Lang et al., $M_{\pi} = 156$ MeV □ Interpretation presented by D. Leinweber this morning



My personal take, need more data...

O Lattice "rule-of-thumb" is to take $M_{\pi}L \sim 4$ or larger

O Here $M_{\pi}L \sim 2.2$

• First three states are statistically consistent with non-interacting nucleons and pions

• Careful with operator overlaps... discretisation dependent, no guarantee of continuum limit

• Lang, Leskovec, Padmanath, Prelovsek (2017) •

□ Naive spectra from MTH and Meyer 2016

O Non-interacting



• MTH and Meyer (2016) • see also Döring et al. (2013) • <u>Daniel Severt LATT2022</u> •

Naive spectra from MTH and Meyer 2016



But, right panel ignores three-body effects!... I would say work is needed

• MTH and Meyer (2016) • see also Döring et al. (2013) • <u>Daniel Severt LATT2022</u> •

 $\Delta \to N\pi$

Andersen et al. 2018
Andersen et al. 2019
Silvi et al. 2021
Pittler et al. 2021
Bulava et al. 2022

 $N^* \to N\pi$

Lang et al. 2017
 Wu et al. 2017
 Kiratidis et al. 2017

 $\Lambda \to \overline{K}N$

□ Hall et al. 2015



(focusing here on studies with scattering states)

Baryons are difficult...

Stay tuned!



See also...

- Detmold and Nicholson 2015
- Wu et al. 2018
- □ Xing & Liu, LATT2022 (in prep)

Journey of a lattice calculation (iv) Baryonic applications (iii) Improved control, towards physical masses (ii) Application in meson sector (often $M_{\pi} > M_{\pi, \text{ phys}}$) (i) Formal developments of methods



Formal progress: Transition amplitudes

 $\square \text{ Weak decay} \qquad \qquad \langle \pi\pi, \text{out} | \mathcal{H} | K \rangle \equiv \bigcirc \longrightarrow \checkmark$

Lellouch, Lüscher (2001) • Kim, Sachrajda, Sharpe (2005) • Christ, Kim, Yamazaki (2005) • MTH, Sharpe (2012)



Agadjanov et al. (2014) • Briceño, MTH, Walker-Loud (2015) • Briceño, MTH (2016)

Pion photo-production

 $\langle \pi\pi, \mathrm{out} | \mathcal{J}_{\mu} | \pi \rangle \equiv$



get this from the lattice

experimental observable

$$|\langle n, L|\mathcal{J}_{\mu}|\pi\rangle|^{2} = \langle \pi|\mathcal{J}_{\mu}|\pi\pi, \mathrm{in}\rangle\mathcal{R}(E_{n}, L)\langle\pi\pi, \mathrm{out}|\mathcal{J}_{\mu}|\pi\rangle$$

Briceño, MTH, Walker-Loud (2015)

Numerical implementation



Formal progress: Towards $N\pi\pi$

Multiple three-particle finite-volume formalisms developed (so far only spin zero)

MTH, Sharpe (2014-2016) *See also Döring, Mai, Hammer, Pang, Rusetsky*

Formal progress: Towards $N\pi\pi$

Multiple three-particle finite-volume formalisms developed (so far only spin zero)

MTH, Sharpe (2014-2016) See also Döring, Mai, Hammer, Pang, Rusetsky

 \Box First lattice calculations appearing... e.g. $\pi^+\pi^+\pi^+ \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^+\pi^+$



O Extract reliable spectrum

- Use formalism to fit scheme-dependent K-matrix
- Solve integral equations to reach physical amplitude

MTH, Briceño, Edwards, Thomas, Wilson, Phys. Rev. Lett. 126 (2021) 012001

Formal progress: Towards $N\pi\pi$

Multiple three-particle finite-volume formalisms developed (so far only spin zero)

MTH, Sharpe (2014-2016) See also Döring, Mai, Hammer, Pang, Rusetsky

 \Box First lattice calculations appearing... e.g. $\pi^+\pi^+\pi^+ \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^+\pi^+$



O Extract reliable spectrum

- Use formalism to fit scheme-dependent K-matrix
- Solve integral equations to reach physical amplitude

MTH, Briceño, Edwards, Thomas, Wilson, Phys. Rev. Lett. 126 (2021) 012001

See Blanton et al. for pion and kaon results

 \Box See Sadasivan et al. for application to $a_1(1260)$

Not discussed here...

Hamiltonian Effective Theory (D. Leinweber, morning talk)

My two cents: Lüscher formalism (+ extensions) uniquely predict spectrum...

• For given amplitudes

O For any interactions (same for $\pi^+\pi^+$ and $N\pi \to \Delta \to N\pi$)

O Up to $e^{-M_{\pi}L}$ + must include all channels

HET gives (i) amplitude model, (ii) pion mass dependence, (iii) quark-model interpretation

Not discussed here...

Hamiltonian Effective Theory (D. Leinweber, morning talk)

My two cents: Lüscher formalism (+ extensions) uniquely predict spectrum...

O For given amplitudes

• For any interactions (same for $\pi^+\pi^+$ and $N\pi \to \Delta \to N\pi$)

• Up to $e^{-M_{\pi}L}$ + must include all channels

HET gives (i) amplitude model, (ii) pion mass dependence, (iii) quark-model interpretation

HAL-QCD potential method

O Extract effective potential from lattice calculation

O Requires derivative expansion

See... Murakami et al.,

Lattice QCD studies on decuplet baryons as meson-baryon bound states in the HAL QCD method

] Excited states in structure calculations

O Next talks from Marcus and Lorenzo

Summary and outlook

Local-operator spectroscopy = useful guide

result of correlator fit, indicating region where finite-volume states strongly overlap local operators

] Robust baryonic scattering studies now appearing

complete finite-volume spectrum, field theoretically mapped to amplitudes

Formal developments are ahead of numerical lattice QCD calculations

 \Box Many scalar resonances + the Δ are very well controlled

Thanks for listening!... questions?

Supported by UKRI FLF

UK Research

and Innovation





Coupled channels

□ The cubic volume mixes different partial waves...

e.g.
$$K\pi \to K\pi \longrightarrow \det \begin{bmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \mathcal{K}_s^{-1} & 0 \\ 0 & \mathcal{K}_p^{-1} \end{pmatrix} + \begin{pmatrix} F_{ss} & F_{sp} \\ F_{ps} & F_{pp} \end{pmatrix} \end{bmatrix} = 0$$

...as well as different flavor channels...

e.g.
$$a = \pi \pi$$

 $b = K\overline{K} \longrightarrow \det \left[\begin{pmatrix} \mathcal{K}_{a \to a} & \mathcal{K}_{a \to b} \\ \mathcal{K}_{b \to a} & \mathcal{K}_{b \to b} \end{pmatrix}^{-1} + \begin{pmatrix} F_a & 0 \\ 0 & F_b \end{pmatrix} \right] = 0$

Workflow...





Applications...

exotic resonance pole positions, couplings, quantum numbers $\omega(782), a_1(1420) \rightarrow \pi\pi\pi \qquad X(3872) \rightarrow J/\psi\pi\pi \qquad X(3915)[Y(3940)] \rightarrow J/\psi\pi\pi$

form factors and transitions

and much more!... (3-body forces, weak transitions, gluons content)

Status...



Identical spin-zero, no 2-to-3, no K2 poles • MTH, Sharpe (2014, 2015) •

as above... but including 2-to-3

including K2 poles

• Briceño, MTH, Sharpe (2017) •

• Briceño, MTH, Sharpe (2018) •

Image: Mon-identical, non-degenerate spin-zero $\pi\pi\pi \to \rho\pi \to \omega \to \rho\pi \to \pi\pi\pi$ • MTH, Romero-López, Sharpe (2020)• Blanton, Sharpe (2020, 2021)

Multiple three-particle channels... Spin!



MTH, Briceño, Edwards, Thomas, Wilson, *Phys.Rev.Lett.* 126 (2021) 012001, see also work by... Culver, Döring, Hanlon, Hörz, Mai, Morningstar, Romero-Lopez, Sharpe + ETMC

