

Spontaneous Hawking radiation, black-hole lasing and beyond: Observing the time evolution of an analogue black hole

> Jeff Steinhauer Juan Ramón Muñoz de Nova Victor I. Kolobov Katrine Golubkov





Black hole thermodynamics (entropy, temperature)

Bekenstein, J. D. Black holes and entropy. Phys. Rev. D 7, 2333 (1973).

Hawking radiation

Hawking, S. W. Black hole explosions? *Nature* **248**, 30 (1974). Hawking, S. W. Particle creation by black holes. *Commun. Math. Phys.* **43**, 199 (1975). *Hawking combined general relativity with quantum field theory.*

$$k_{\rm B}T_{\rm H} = \hbar g/2\pi c$$

Information paradox

Hawking, S. W. Breakdown of predictability in gravitational collapse. *Phys. Rev. D* **14**, 2460 (1976).

Wald, R. M. On particle creation by black holes. *Commun. Math. Phys.* 45, 9 (1975).





Graybody factors

Page, D. N. Particle emission rates from a black hole: Massless particles from an uncharged, nonrotating hole. *Phys. Rev. D* **13**, 198 (1976).

Visser, M. Thermality of the Hawking Flux. J. High Energ. Phys. 9 (2015).

Hawking radiation from very small black holes

Page, D. N. Particle emission rates from a black hole: Massless particles from an uncharged, nonrotating hole. *Phys. Rev. D* 13, 198 (1976).
Dimopoulos, S. & Landsberg, G. Black holes at the large hadron collider. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 87, 161602 (2001).
Giddings, S. B. & Thomas, S. High energy colliders as black hole factories: The end of short distance physics. *Phys. Rev. D* 65, 056010 (2002).
Hawking radiation in an analogue black hole

Unruh, W. G. Experimental black-hole evaporation? *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **46**, 1351 (1981). *"Black-hole evaporation is one of the most surprising discoveries of the past ten years."*

$$k_{\rm B}T_{\rm H} = \hbar g/2\pi d$$





Bose-Einstein condensates

- Garay, L. J., Anglin, J. R., Cirac, J. I. & Zoller, P., Sonic analog of gravitational black holes in Bose-Einstein condensates. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **85**, 4643 (2000).
- Barceló, C., Liberati, S. & Visser, M. Analogue gravity from Bose-Einstein condensates. *Class. Quant. Grav.* **18**, 1137 (2001).
- Recati, A., Pavloff, N. & Carusotto, I. Bogoliubov theory of acoustic Hawking radiation in Bose-Einstein condensates. *Phys. Rev. A* **80**, 043603 (2009).
- Zapata, I., Albert, M., Parentani, R. & Sols, F. Resonant Hawking radiation in Bose– Einstein Condensates. *New J. Phys.* **13**, 063048 (2011).
- Balbinot, R., Fabbri, A., Fagnocchi, S., Recati, A. & Carusotto, I. Nonlocal density correlations as a signature of Hawking radiation from acoustic black holes. *Phys. Rev. A* **78**, 021603(R) (2008).
- Macher, J. & Parentani, R. Black-hole radiation in Bose-Einstein condensates. *Phys. Rev. A* **80**, 043601 (2009).
- Carusotto, I., Fagnocchi, S., Recati, A., Balbinot, R. & Fabbri, A. Numerical observation of Hawking radiation from acoustic black holes in atomic Bose–Einstein condensates. New J. Phys. 10, 103001 (2008).
- Larré, P.-É., Recati, A., Carusotto, I. & Pavloff, N. Quantum fluctuations around black hole horizons in Bose-Einstein condensates. *Phys. Rev. A* **85**, 013621 (2012)





Bose-Einstein condensates (continued)

Busch, X. & Parentani, R. Quantum entanglement in analogue Hawking radiation: When is the final state nonseparable? *Phys. Rev. D* 89, 105024 (2014). Finazzi, S. & Carusotto, I. Entangled phonons in atomic Bose-Einstein condensates. Phys. Rev. A 90, 033607 (2014). Steinhauer, J. Measuring the entanglement of analogue Hawking radiation by the density-density correlation function. Phys. Rev. D 92, 024043 (2015). de Nova, J. R. M., Sols, F. & Zapata, I. Violation of Cauchy-Schwarz inequalities by spontaneous Hawking radiation in resonant boson structures. Phys. Rev. A **89**, 043808 (2014). Doukas, J. Adesso, G. & Fuentes, I. Ruling out stray thermal radiation in analogue black holes. arXiv 1404.4324. Boiron, D., Fabbri, A., Larré, P.-É., Pavloff, N., Westbrook, C. I. & Ziń, P. Quantum signature of analog Hawking radiation in momentum space. Phys. Rev. Lett. **115**, 025301 (2015). de Nova, J. R. M., Sols, F. & Zapata, I. Entanglement and violation of classical inequalities in the Hawking radiation of flowing atom Technion -- Israel condensates. New J. Phys. 17, 105003 (2015). Institute of Technology



Bose-Einstein condensates (continued)

Michel, F., Coupechoux, J.-F. & Parentani, R. Phonon spectrum and correlations in a transonic flow of an atomic Bose gas. *Phys. Rev. D* 94, 084027 (2016).
Coutant A. & Weinfurtner, S. Low-frequency analogue Hawking radiation: The Bogoliubov-de Gennes model. *Phys. Rev. D* 97, 025006 (2018).
Fabbri, A. & Pavloff, N. Momentum correlations as signature of sonic Hawking radiation in Bose-Einstein condensates. *SciPost Phys.* 4, 019 (2018).
Robertson, S., Michel, F. & Parentani, R. Assessing degrees of entanglement of phonon states in atomic Bose gases through the measurement of commuting observables. *Phys. Rev. D* 96, 045012 (2017).







Superfluid ³He Jacobson T. A. & Volovik, G. E. Event horizons and ergoregions in ³He. *Phys. Rev. D* 58, 064021 (1998).
Electromagnetic waveguide Schützhold, R. & Unruh, W. G. Hawking radiation in an electromagnetic waveguide? *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 95, 031301 (2005).
Ultracold Fermions Giovanazzi, S. Hawking radiation in sonic black holes. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 94, 061302 (2005). Giovanazzi, S. Entanglement entropy and mutual information production rates in acoustic black holes. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 106, 011302 (2011).
Ring of trapped ions Horstmann, B., Reznik, B., Fagnocchi, S. & Cirac, J. I. Hawking radiation from an acoustic black hole on an ion ring. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 104, 250403 (2010).







Light in a nonlinear liquid

Elazar, M. Fleurov, V. & Bar-Ad, S. All-optical event horizon in an optical analog of a Laval nozzle. *Phys. Rev. A* 86, 063821 (2012).

Exciton-polariton condensates

Solnyshkov, D. D., Flayac, H. & Malpuech, G. Black holes and wormholes in spinor polariton condensates. *Phys. Rev. B* **84**, 233405 (2011).

Magnons in a magnetic wire

Roldan-Molina, A., Nunez, A. S. & Duine R. A. Magnonic Black Holes. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **118**, 061301 (2017).

Jannes, G, Maïssa, P., Philbin, T. G. & Rousseaux, G. Hawking radiation and the boomerang behavior of massive modes near a horizon. *Phys. Rev. D* 83, 104028 (2011).

Weyl semimetals

Volovik, G. E. Black Hole and Hawking Radiation by Type-II Weyl Fermions. *JETP Letters* **104**, 645 (2016).





Experimental background

Bose-Einstein condensates

Lahav, O., Itah, A., Blumkin, A., Gordon, C., Rinott, S., Zayats, A. & Steinhauer, J. Realization of a sonic black hole analog in a Bose-Einstein condensate. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **105**, 240401 (2010). Shammass, I., Rinott, S., Berkovitz, A., Schley, R. & Steinhauer, J. Phonon dispersion relation of an atomic Bose-Einstein condensate. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **109**, 195301 (2012). Schley, R., Berkovitz, A., Rinott, S., Shammass, I., Blumkin, A. & Steinhauer, J. Planck Distribution of Phonons in a Bose-Einstein Condensate. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **111**, 055301 (2013). Steinhauer, J. Observation of self-amplifying Hawking radiation in an analog black hole laser. Nature Phys. 10, 864 (2014). Steinhauer, J. Observation of quantum Hawking radiation and its entanglement in an analogue black hole. Nature Phys. 12, 959 (2016). de Nova, J. R. M., Golubkov, K., Kolobov, V. I. & Steinhauer, J. Observation of thermal Hawking radiation and its temperature in an analogue black hole. *Nature* 569, 688 (2019). Kolobov, V. I., Golubkov, K., de Nova, J. R. M. & Steinhauer, J. Spontaneous Hawking radiation and beyond: Observing the time evolution of an analogue black hole. arXiv:1910.09363 (2019).





Experimental background

Surface waves in water

- Rousseaux, G., Mathis, C., Maïssa, P., Philbin, T. G. & Leonhardt, U. Observation of negative-frequency waves in a water tank: a classical analogue to the Hawking effect? *New J. Phys.* **10**, 053015 (2008).
- Weinfurtner, S., Tedford, E. W., Penrice, M. C. J., Unruh, W. G. & Lawrence, G. A.
 Measurement of stimulated Hawking emission in an analogue system.
 Phys. Rev. Lett. **106**, 021302 (2011).
- Euvé, L.-P., Michel, F., Parentani, R., Philbin, T. G. & Rousseaux, G. Observation of noise correlated by the Hawking effect in a water tank. PRL **117**, 121301 (2016).







Experimental background

Non-linear optical fibers

Philbin, T. G., Kuklewicz, C., Robertson, S., Hill, S., König, F. & Leonhardt, U. Fiberoptical analog of the event horizon. Science **319**, 1367-1370 (2008). Belgiorno, F., Cacciatori, S. L., Clerici, M., Gorini, V., Ortenzi, G., Rizzi, L., Rubino, E., Sala, V. G. & Faccio, D. Hawking Radiation from Ultrashort Laser Pulse Filaments. Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 203901 (2010). Unruh, W. & Schützhold, R. Hawking radiation from "phase horizons" in laser filaments? Phys. Rev. D 86, 064006 (2012). Liberati, S., Prain, A. & Visser, M. Quantum vacuum radiation in optical glass. *Phys. Rev. D* **85**, 084014 (2012). Drori, J., Rosenberg, Y., Bermudez, D., Silberberg, Y. & Leonhardt, U. Observation of stimulated Hawking radiation in an optical analogue. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **122**, 010404 (2019). **Exciton-polariton condensate** Nguyen, H. S., Gerace, D., Carusotto, I., Sanvitto, D., Galopin, E., Lemaître, A., Sagnes, I., Bloch, J. & Amo, A. Acoustic Black Hole in a Stationary Hydrodynamic Flow of Microcavity Polaritons. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **114**, 036402 (2015).







halogue expanding universe

Gibbons-Hawking Effect (theory) Similar to the Unruh Effect Fedichev, Petr O. & Fischer, Uwe R. Gibbons-Hawking Effect in the Sonic de Sitter Space-Time of an Expanding Bose-Einstein-Condensed Gas. PRL 91, 240407 (2003).

Analogue cosmological particle production (theory) Similar to the Dynamical Casimir Effect

- Barceló, C., Liberati, S. & Visser, M. Analogue models for FRW cosmologies. *Int. J. Mod. Phys. D* **12**, 1641 (2003).
- Barceló, C., Liberati, S. & Visser, M. Probing semiclassical analog gravity in Bose-Einstein condensates with widely tunable interactions. *PRA* 68, 053613 (2003).
 Fedichev, Petr O. & Fischer, Uwe R. "Cosmological" quasiparticle production in harmonically trapped superfluid gases. *PRA* 69, 033602 (2004).
 Fischer, Uwe R. & Schützhold, R. Quantum simulation of cosmic inflation in two-component Bose-Einstein condensates. *PRA* 70, 063615 (2004).

Nonlinear dynamics (experiment)

Eckel, S., Kumar, A., Jacobson, T., Spielman, I. B., & Campbell, G. K. A rapidly expanding Bose-Einstein condensate: An expanding universe in the lab. *PRX* 8, 021021 (2018).





Analogue black hole



de Nova, J. R. M., Golubkov, K., Kolobov, V. I. & Steinhauer, J. Observation of thermal Hawking radiation and its temperature in an analogue black hole. *Nature* 569, 688 (2019).





Experimental system







Apparatus (top view)







Waterfall potential









Experimental Technique



Lahav, O., Itah, A., Blumkin, A., Gordon, C., Rinott, S., Zayats, A. & Steinhauer, J. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **105**, 240401 (2010).





Experimental Technique













Reference images





11111































The metric



 $k_{\rm B}T_{\rm H} = \hbar g/2\pi c$

 $g = c(dv/dx - dc/dx)\Big|_{x=0}$ Visser, M. Class. Quantum Grav. **15**, 1767-1791 (1998). based on linear dispersion J = nv = constant

$$k_{\rm B}T_{\rm H} = -\frac{\hbar}{2\pi} \left(\frac{c}{n} \frac{dn}{dx} + \frac{dc}{dx} \right) \bigg|_{x=0}$$

Kolobov, V. I., Golubkov, K., de Nova, J. R. M. & Steinhauer, J., arXiv:1910.09363 (2019).

Technion -- Israel Institute of Technology



:0



dicted Hawking temperature







Correlation function

Balbinot, R., Fabbri, A., Fagnocchi, S., Recati, A. & Carusotto, I. *Phys. Rev. A* **78**, 021603(R) (2008).



This is how we observe Hawking radiation

Giovanazzi, S. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **106**, 011302 (2011).

 $G^{(2)}(x,x') = \sqrt{n_{\text{out}}n_{\text{in}}\xi_{\text{out}}\xi_{\text{in}}} \langle \delta n(x)\delta n(x') \rangle / n_{\text{out}}n_{\text{in}}$





ime dependence of Hawking radiation

Correlations between Hawking and partner particles

Total of 97,000 images Corresponds to 124 days

Kolobov, V. I., Golubkov, K., de Nova, J. R. M. & Steinhauer, J., arXiv:1910.09363 (2019).



t = 66, 72, 95 ms

t = 104, 109, 124 ms

t = 150, 153, 181 ms

t = 236, 265, 279 ms

t = 312, 348, 382 ms





potaneous Hawking radiation



deeper band \Rightarrow More Hawking radiation \Rightarrow high temperature

t = 104, 109, 124, 150, 153, 181 ms





taneous, stationary Hawking radiation at the predicted Hawking temperature







ontaneous Hawking radiation



narrow width \Rightarrow short wavelength \Rightarrow high temperature

t = 104, 109, 124, 150, 153, 181 ms





ntaneous, thermal, stationary Hawking on at the predicted Hawking temperature







itational collapse of a cloud of dust

170 solar masses

 $\Phi_{\infty} \propto T_{\rm H}^4$ t_{∞}

R. Brout, S. Massar, R. Parentani, and Ph. Spindel, A primer for black hole quantum physics. Phys. Rept. **260**, 329-446 (1995).





mp up of Hawking radiation







imulated Hawking radiation







The metric







imulated Hawking radiation



 $\omega = k_0 v_{\rm IH}$

Steven Corley and Ted Jacobson, Black hole lasers. *Phys. Rev. D* 59, 124011 (1999).

Yi-Hsieh Wang, Ted Jacobson, Mark Edwards, and Charles W. Clark, Mechanism of stimulated Hawking radiation in a laboratory Bose-Einstein condensate. Phys. Rev. A **96**, 023616 (2017).

Lorentz violation might occur well beyond the Planck scale G. E. Volovik, Black hole and Hawking radiation by Type-II Weyl Fermions. JETP Letters **104**, 645-648 (2016).





X





cillating horizon experiment



Lahav, O., Itah, A., Blumkin, A., Gordon, C., Rinott, S., Zayats, A. & Steinhauer, J. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **105**, 240401 (2010).





cillating horizon experiment





cillating horizon experiment









Iti-mode stimulated Hawking radiation













Single modes







Profiles







Conclusions

- The Hawking radiation is seen to be spontaneous, thermal, at the correct temperature, and stationary.
- 6 independent measurements of Hawking radiation are made in the spontaneous period.
- Thus, the semiclassical regime has been verified in an analogue black hole.
- This confirms Hawking's calculation.
- Stimulated Hawking radiation is also seen.







mplications for real gravity

- The thermality of Hawking radiation is the basis for the information paradox.
- The temperature links Hawking radiation with black hole entropy.
- The correlations between the Hawking and partner modes are of the predicted magnitude, with no reduction due to the underlying quantum structure.







Future

- Going beyond the semiclassical approximation
- *Getting information regarding quantum gravity*





Could quantum gravity models be tested in some type of analogue system? Proposals are needed.







Large Hadron Collider

- They are searching for semiclassical and quantum black holes at the LHC.
- They could study the Hawking radiation and see the effect of QG.







Future

- Going beyond the semiclassical approximation
- *Getting information regarding quantum gravity*









Analogue black holes

- We would like Quantum Gravity to definitively answer the following questions:
 - What is the role of quantum gravity in the information paradox?
 - How does quantum gravity affect Hawking radiation?
- Let's first answer an easier question:
 - How does analogue quantum gravity affect
 Hawking radiation in an analogue black hole?







semiclassical approximation

- We partially ignore the underlying quantum (atomic) structure
- Assume that the BEC is smooth (Gross-Pitaevskii equation)
- Compute the spectrum of linear excitations
- Quantum field theory
- Current simulations are only valid when the fluctuations are small.





Analogue quantum gravity

- What is the backreaction of the phonons onto the analogue black hole?
- What is the effect of phonon-phonon interactions on the Hawking radiation?

The interactions between particles should be increased to increase the effect of Analogue Quantum Gravity (AQG).

Theory

- Analytical studies are needed.
- New simulation techniques are needed.

Experiment

• Strongly-interacting condensates could be studied.







nochromatic stimulated Hawking radiation

 $\omega = -k_0 v_{\rm IH}$

Yi-Hsieh Wang, Ted Jacobson, Mark Edwards, and Charles W. Clark, Mechanism of stimulated Hawking radiation in a laboratory Bose-Einstein condensate. Phys. Rev. A **96**, 023616 (2017).





Landau critical velocity

Superfluid



The particle sees a Dopplershifted dispersion relation.

Production of quasiparticles

$$\omega' = \omega(k) - \mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{v}$$

 $\omega' = 0$ Bogoliubov-Cherenkov radiation

