PP@LHC 2016, PISA - 16 MAY 2016



Andrea De Simone



MOSTLY BASED ON: DS, JACQUES - ARXIV:1603.08002 (REVIEW) BOVEIA ET AL. - ARXIV:1603.04156 (LHCDMWG)

#### OUTLINE

• a quick journey in theory space

• simplified models (s-channel, t-channel)

• some recommendations & future directions

#### TO WIMP OR NOT TO WIMP...



we are only sure that DM has gravitational interactions



#### THEORY SPACE

More complete/ more parameters

# MSSM, Composite Higgs, Extra-Dim...





lots of parameters...

Complete

**Models** 

#### **THEORY SPACE**

More complete/ more parameters

Complete

Models





Integrate out the UV physics connecting DM-SM and describe interactions with eff. ops.:

$$\frac{1}{\Lambda^2} (\bar{\chi} \Gamma^A \chi) (\bar{q} \Gamma_A q)$$

LHC can access regions beyond the validity of the eff. description

need to use EFT <u>carefully</u> and <u>consistently</u>

the momentum transfer in the relevant process must be  $~Q_{
m tr} \lesssim M_{
m med}$ 

#### LHC VS DIRECT DETECTION

#### The "money plots"

L=20.3 fb<sup>-1</sup>



#### **EFT DISCOVERY POTENTIAL**



"There's a way to do it better. **Find it**." T.A. Edison

# EFT approach

- limited validity
- not entirely model-independent

# How to go beyond that (but keeping generality), in view of LHC Run 2?

Simplified Models

#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS



#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS

... just means extending the SM with:

- 1 Dark Matter particle
- 1 Mediator particle connecting DM-SM

>> just another parametrization of unknown high energy physics <<



no worries about EFT, widths, etc.

#### from DM search to MEDIATOR search



still, a lot to do here...

[more in Valerio's talk...]

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

Simplified Models for Dark Matter and Missing Energy Searches at the LHC

Jalal Abdallah,<sup>1</sup> Adi Ashkenazi,<sup>2</sup> Antonio Boveia,<sup>3</sup> Giorgio Busoni,<sup>4</sup> Andrea De Simone,<sup>4</sup> Caterina Doglioni,<sup>5</sup> Aielet Efrati,<sup>6</sup> Erez Etzion,<sup>2</sup> Johanna Gramling,<sup>5</sup> Thomas Jacques,<sup>5</sup> Tongyan Lin,<sup>7</sup> Enrico Morgante,<sup>5</sup> Michele Papucci,<sup>8,9</sup> Bjoern Penning,<sup>3,10</sup> Antonio Walter Riotto,<sup>5</sup> Thomas Rizzo,<sup>11</sup> David Salek,<sup>12</sup> Steven Schramm,<sup>13</sup> Oren Slone,<sup>2</sup> Yotam Soreq,<sup>6</sup> Alessandro Vichi,<sup>8,9</sup> Tomer Volansky,<sup>2</sup> Itay Yavin,<sup>14,15</sup> Ning Zhou,<sup>16</sup> and Kathryn Zurek<sup>8,9</sup>

#### [1409.2893] ATLAS/CMS DM Forum

#### Interplay and Characterization of Dark Matter Searches at Colliders and in Direct Detection Experiments

Sarah A. Malik,<sup>*a*</sup> Christopher McCabe,<sup>*b,c*</sup> Henrique Araujo,<sup>*a*</sup> Alexander Belyaev,<sup>*d,e*</sup> Céline Bœhm,<sup>*b*</sup> Jim Brooke,<sup>*f*</sup> Oliver Buchmueller,<sup>*a*</sup> Gavin Davies,<sup>*a*</sup> Albert De Roeck,<sup>*g,h*</sup> Kees de Vries,<sup>*a*</sup> Matthew J. Dolan,<sup>*i*</sup> John Ellis,<sup>*g,j*</sup> Malcolm Fairbairn,<sup>*j*</sup> Henning Flaecher,<sup>*f*</sup> Loukas Gouskos,<sup>*k*</sup> Valentin V. Khoze,<sup>*b*</sup> Greg Landsberg,<sup>*l*</sup> Dave Newbold,<sup>*f*</sup> Michele Papucci,<sup>*m*</sup> Timothy Sumner,<sup>*a*</sup> Marc Thomas<sup>*d,e*</sup> and Steven Worm<sup>*e*</sup>

#### [1409.4075]

Recommendations on presenting LHC searches for missing transverse energy signals using simplified <u>s-channel</u> models

of dark matter

Antonio Boveia,<sup>1,\*</sup> Oliver Buchmueller,<sup>2,\*</sup> Giorgio Busoni,<sup>3</sup> Francesco D'Eramo,<sup>4</sup> Albert De Roeck,<sup>1,5</sup> Andrea De Simone,<sup>6</sup> Caterina Doglioni,<sup>7,\*</sup> Matthew J. Dolan,<sup>3</sup> Marie-Helene Genest,<sup>8</sup> Kristian Hahn,<sup>9,\*</sup> Ulrich Haisch,<sup>10,11,\*</sup> Philip C. Harris,<sup>1</sup> Jan Heisig,<sup>12</sup> Valerio Ippolito,<sup>13</sup> Felix Kahlhoefer,<sup>14,\*</sup> Valentin V. Khoze,<sup>15</sup> Suchita Kulkarni,<sup>16</sup> Greg Landsberg,<sup>17</sup> Steven Lowette,<sup>18</sup> Sarah Malik,<sup>2</sup> Michelangelo Mangano,<sup>11,\*</sup> Christopher McCabe,<sup>19,\*</sup> Stephen Mrenna,<sup>20</sup> Priscilla Pani,<sup>21</sup> Tristan du Pree,<sup>1</sup> Antonio Riotto,<sup>11</sup> David Salek,<sup>19,22</sup> Kai Schmidt-Hoberg,<sup>14</sup> William Shepherd,<sup>23</sup> Tim M.P. Tait,<sup>24,\*</sup> Lian-Tao Wang,<sup>25</sup> Steven Worm<sup>26</sup> and Kathryn Zurek<sup>27</sup>

### LHC DM WG

#### A. De Simone

[1603.04156]

#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS OVERVIEW

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name
0	S	0	0.80
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$
0	t	0	0t0
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$

#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS OVERVIEW

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	q <b>DM</b>
0	S	0		
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	Q DM
0	t	0	0t0	q DM
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	generic
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	S-Channel models
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	
1	S	0		
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	

#### S-CHANNEL MODELS

DM is a Dirac Fermion

Scalar and Pseudo-Scalar Models:

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{scalar}} = -g_{\text{DM}}\phi\bar{\chi}\chi - g_q \frac{\phi}{\sqrt{2}} \sum_{q=u,d,s,c,b,t} y_q \bar{q}q, \quad (0_{\text{S}}\text{S1/2})$$
$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{pseudo-scalar}} = -ig_{\text{DM}}\phi\bar{\chi}\gamma_5\chi - ig_q \frac{\phi}{\sqrt{2}} \sum_{q=u,d,s,c,b,t} y_q \bar{q}\gamma_5q, \quad (0_{\text{P}}\text{S1/2})$$

Vector and Axial-Vector Models:

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{vector}} = -g_{\text{DM}} Z'_{\mu} \bar{\chi} \gamma^{\mu} \chi - g_q \sum_{q=u,d,s,c,b,t} Z'_{\mu} \bar{q} \gamma^{\mu} q , \qquad (1_{\text{VS1/2}})$$
$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{axial-vector}} = -g_{\text{DM}} Z'_{\mu} \bar{\chi} \gamma^{\mu} \gamma_5 \chi - g_q \sum_{q=u,d,s,c,b,t} Z'_{\mu} \bar{q} \gamma^{\mu} \gamma_5 q . \qquad (1_{\text{AS1/2}})$$

 $\mathbf{ }$ 

4-dimensional parameter space:  $\{m_{\mathrm{DM}}, M_{\mathrm{med}}, g_{\mathrm{DM}}, g_q\}$ 

#### THE MASS-MASS PLANE

[1604.04156]



Recommended choices	Vector mediator: $g_{\text{DM}} = 1$ and $g_q = 0.25$ .		
of couplings:	Axial-vector mediator: $g_{\text{DM}} = 1$ and $g_q = 0.25$ .	ensure	$\Gamma_{\rm med}/M_{\rm med} \lesssim 10\%$
(universal a)	Scalar mediator: $g_q = 1$ and $g_{DM} = 1$ .	avoid c	urrent limits
(universal <i>g</i> <sub>q</sub> )	<b>Pseudo-scalar mediator:</b> $g_q = 1$ and $g_{DM} = 1$ .		

#### **ONTO THE DIRECT DETECTION PLANE**



$$\sigma_{\rm SI,SD} \propto \frac{(g_q g_{\rm DM})^2}{M_{\rm med}^4}$$

then plug in  $M_{med}$  from the mass-mass plane

recommend to plot 90% CL (instead of 95% CL) to comply with DD standards

#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS OVERVIEW

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	q \ H.S DM	
0	S	0	0.80		Higgs mediator
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$		calar-Higgs Portal
0	t	0	0 <i>t</i> 0	₫ DM	
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	<i>s</i> -channe	I models
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	(special	cases)
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	q 🔪 🗾 Z 🕞 DM	
1	S	0	1s0		
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$		Z mediator
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	q DM	

#### 1s1/2 Model (Z Mediator)

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	
0	S	0	0.80	model parameters: $\{m_{\mathrm{DM}},g\}$
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	relevant constraints:
0	t	0	0t0	- Direct detection ( $m_{ m DM}>m_Z/2$ )
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	- Z invisible width ( $m_{\rm DM} < m_Z/2$ and SD scattering)
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	mono-jet searches not competitive
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	
				DS, Giudice, Strumia - 1402.6287]

#### **OS1/2 MODEL (HIGGS MEDIATOR)**

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	q H DM
0	S	0	0.80	
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	
0	t	0	0t0	q y DM
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	Model parameters: $\{m_{\mathrm{DM}}, y\}$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	relevant constraints: - Direct detection ( $m_{ m DM} > m_h/2$ )
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	- Higgs invisible width ( $m_{ m DM} < m_h/2$ )
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	mono-jet searches not competitive
				[DS, Giudice, Strumia - 1402.6287]

[DS, Giudice, Strumia - 1402.6287]

Near resonance m<sub>DM</sub>~M<sub>Z,h</sub>/2, relic density fixed by the width

### Curves for correct DM relic abundance:



#### **OS1/2 MODEL (SCALAR-HIGGS PORTAL)**

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	q 🔪 S/H 🧹 DM
0	S	0	0.50	S "talks" to SM only via H
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	mixing of real scalar mediator S and Higgs
0	t	0	0t0	looks like a 2HDM, with <s>=0</s>
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	$\mathscr{L} \supset \frac{1}{2} (\partial_{\mu} S)^2 - \frac{1}{2} m_S^2 S^2 + \bar{\chi} (i \partial - m_{\chi}) \chi - \frac{h}{\sqrt{2}} \sum_f y_f \bar{f} f$
		1		$-y_{\chi}S\bar{\chi}\chi-\mu_{S}S H ^{2}-\lambda_{S}S^{2} H ^{2}.$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	Model parameters: $\{m_{\chi}, m_{S}, \lambda_{S}, \mu_{S}\}$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	$ \begin{pmatrix} h_1 \\ h_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \cos \theta & \sin \theta \\ -\sin \theta & \cos \theta \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} h \\ S \end{pmatrix} \longrightarrow \begin{pmatrix} m_{h_1} \simeq m_h \\ m_{h_2} \simeq \sqrt{m_S^2 + \lambda_S^2 v^2} $
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	$\tan(2\theta) = 2\nu\mu_S/(m_S^2 - m_h^2 + \lambda_S v^2)$
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	In the mass-eigenstate basis:
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	$\mathscr{L} \supset -(h_1 \cos \theta - h_2 \sin \theta) \sum_f \frac{y_f}{\sqrt{2}} \bar{f} f - (h_1 \sin \theta + h_2 \cos \theta) y_{\chi} \bar{\chi} \chi$ Higgs Yukawas reduced by $\cos \theta$

#### **OS1/2 MODEL (SCALAR-HIGGS PORTAL)** $W^{\pm}/Z$ DM spin Model Name Mediator spin Channel $\chi$ **LHC** signals $1/h_2$ 0 0 0*s*0 S mono-jet + $\frac{1}{2}$ 0 $0s\frac{1}{2}$ S $\bar{\chi}$ $W^{\pm}/Z$ $q_{V^{\pm}/Z}$ $W^{\pm}/Z$ $\nabla W^{\pm}/Z$ mono-W $\chi$ 0 0 0*t*0 $h_1/h_2$ $h_1/h_2$ t $\bar{\chi}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ $0t\frac{lg}{2}$ 0 mono-Higgs t $\bar{\chi}$ Lee 1 t $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}t0$ 0 g $uuuu_{\uparrow}$ $\bar{\chi}$ $h_1$ t $\boldsymbol{q}$ Lee $t_t h_1/h_2$ t $\chi$ *leee*e $h_2$ $h_1/h_2$ $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$ t القحقو tg $\mathfrak{s}$ g uuuu $h_{1\,t}$ $\chi$ h $h_2$ g 999 g uuuu 0 1 1*s*0 S $h_1$ >> combine with inv. width, VBF... $\frac{1}{2}$ $1s\frac{1}{2}$ 1 S A playground for testing $\frac{1}{2}$ $1t\frac{1}{2}$ 1 t complementarity techniques

#### SIMPLIFIED MODELS OVERVIEW

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	t-chan	nel models
0	S	0	0.50		
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	no tree-level	<i>Leitmotiv:</i> mediator carries non-trivial quantum numbers
0	t	0	0t0		q DM
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$		
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$		
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$		g DM – DM
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	<u> </u>	, q ~ 0t1/2
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	q DM	g cxcept for ID/DD g dim-5 dipole
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	q M	~0t1/2

#### OT1/2 MODEL

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	
0	S	0	0.00	
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	$\eta$ carries <b>color, EW, flavor</b> $\eta$ (if DM total singlet)
0	t	0	0t0	q     Image: The squark-like mediator
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	possible to couple $\eta$ to: $u_R$ , $d_R$ , $Q_L$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	choose u <sub>R</sub> :
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	$\mathscr{L}_{0t\frac{1}{2}} \supset \sum_{i=1,2,3} \left[ \frac{1}{2} (\partial_{\mu} \eta_{i})^{2} - \frac{1}{2} M_{i}^{2} \eta_{i}^{2} + (g_{i} \eta_{i}^{*} \bar{\chi} u_{i} + \text{h.c.}) \right]$ $M_{1} = M_{2} = M_{2}$
1	s	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	MFV: $MFV: a_1 = a_2 = a_3 \equiv a$
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	Model parameters: $\{m_\chi, M, g\}$
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	g is a free parameter ( <u>unlike SUSY</u> )





- In s-channel models: play with Scalar-Higgs Portal model
- In t-channel models: the mediator typically carries charges (QCD, EW produciton possible) Next-in-line to be explored

# Fully exploit complementarity <<</p>

## then what? simplified models v. 2.0?

- guided by new hints/excesses/discoveries in future data
- new collider signatures, different from mono-X ?
- more degrees of freedom/more parameters? loop mediation?
  …?

# **BACK UP**



#### 1s1/2 Model (Z Mediator)



#### **OS1/2 MODEL (HIGGS MEDIATOR)**



#### 1/2TO MODEL

in   Model Name	Channel D	q <b>, DM</b>	
0.50	S	mediator $\psi$ is a vector-like ferm	nion
$0s\frac{1}{2}$	S	$\psi$ carrying <b>color</b> , <b>EW</b> and <b>flavor</b> (if DM total singlet)	•
0t0	t		
1		possible to couple to: $q_R$ , $Q_L$	
$0t\frac{1}{2}$	t	choose q <sub>R</sub> :	
		$\mathscr{L}_{1,\alpha} \supset \frac{1}{2} (\partial_{\mu} \phi)^2 - \frac{1}{2} m_{\phi} \phi^2 + \overline{\psi} (i D - M_{\mu}) \psi + (\nu \phi \overline{\psi} a_B + 1)$	h.c.)
$\frac{1}{2}t0$	t	$\frac{1}{2}t_0 = 2^{(0\mu\gamma)} + 2^{$	
$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	t	pretty much the same story as 0t1/2 (for LHC)	
1 <i>s</i> 0	S		
$1s\frac{1}{2}$	S	different results for (in)direct detection e.g. $\langle \sigma v \rangle$ is d-wave suppressed (v <sup>4</sup> )	N
$1t\frac{1}{2}$	t t		



Xenon-1T will probe TeV region of DM mass

#### 1/2T1/2 MODEL

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name	g , DM
0	S	0	0.50	$\psi$ fermion color-octet (aluino-like)
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$	$\psi$ in SUSY: gluon-gluino-bino
0	t	0	0t0	9
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$	$\mathscr{L}_{\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}} \supset \bar{\psi}^a(i\not{D} - M)\psi^a + \frac{1}{\Lambda}G^a_{\mu\nu}(\bar{\psi}^a\sigma^{\mu\nu}\chi + \text{h.c.})$ dimension-5 dipole operator
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$	
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$	weak signals for LHC, maybe future colliders
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0	[details not worked out]
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$	
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$	

#### 1T1/2 MODEL

Mediator spin	Channel	DM spin	Model Name
0	S	0	0.80
0	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0s\frac{1}{2}$
0	t	0	0t0
0	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$0t\frac{1}{2}$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	0	$\frac{1}{2}t0$
$\frac{1}{2}$	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}t\frac{1}{2}$
1	S	0	1 <i>s</i> 0
1	S	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1s\frac{1}{2}$
1	t	$\frac{1}{2}$	$1t\frac{1}{2}$

q q DM

vector mediator carries color, EW and flavor

similar story as 0t1/2 (squark-like mediator)

[details not worked out]

#### LOOP MEDIATION

#### **Beyond tree-level mediation?**

a model for scalar DM interacting with gluons

[Godbole, Mendiratta, Tait - 1506.01408]



 $\chi\,$  : DM, complex scalar, gauge singlet

 $\phi_i$  : scalar mediator, color-triplet, EM charged, flavour triplet

[other color reps. (e.g. octet) not explored]

$$\mathcal{L} \supset \partial_{\mu} \chi^* \partial^{\mu} \chi - m_{\chi}^2 |\chi|^2 + (D_{\mu} \phi)^{\dagger} D^{\mu} \phi - m_{\phi}^2 |\phi|^2$$
[neglected mixing with H]
$$+ \lambda_d |\chi|^2 |\phi|^2 + \text{ inter. with quarks}$$

$$\epsilon_{ijk}\phi_i u_j u_k$$
  $\searrow$   $y_1 \ (\phi_1 c_R - \phi_2 u_R) t_R + y_2 \ \phi_3 u_R c_R$  (flavour singlet, MFV)

#### LOOP MEDIATION

[Godbole, Mendiratta, Tait - 1506.01408]



#### LOOP MEDIATION

dark penguins



[Weiner, Yavin - 1209.1093] [Primulando, Salvioni, Tsai - 1503.04204]

color-octet scalar mediator (0t1/2)



 $\eta~$  interaction with DM is not renormalizable

 $\eta~$  interaction with gluons: only in pairs  $\sim \eta\eta G, \eta\eta GG$ 

 $\eta$  interaction with quarks: suppressed by  $m_q$ 

[not worked out]